CITY OF HUNTSVILLE, TEXAS

Dick Lindeman, Position 1 Wayne Barrett, Position 2 Connie Heiland, Position 3



Lanny D. Ray, Position 4 Charles Forbus, Position 5, Chair

HOTEL OCCUPANCY TAX BOARD MEETING AGENDA THURSDAY, APRIL 9, 2009 – 5:30pm

CITY HALL CONFERENCE ROOM HUNTSVILLE CITY HALL, 1212 AVENUE M

Persons with disabilities who plan to attend this meeting and who may need auxiliary aids or services are requested to contact Stephanie Brim, City Secretary, at 936.291.5403, two working days prior to the meeting so appropriate arrangements can be made.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. CITIZEN INPUT
- III. DISCUSSION/ACTION The Committee will meet to discuss, hear presentations and/or reports and potentially take action on the following items:
 - A. Minutes of the February 19th, 2009 meeting [Brim; 1-4]
 - B. Review and discuss Comptroller's presentation at March 19th work session [Forbus]
 - C. Usage and accountability of HOT funds by Huntsville-Walker County Chamber of Commerce as a Tax Code Chapter 351 delegated entity [Ray]
 - a. Presentation by Chamber [Thomas]
 - b. Questions and answers on submitted documentation and reports [All; 5-54]
 - c. Review, discuss, and consider action on submitted reports [HOT Board Members]
 - Review of current uses of HOT funds and recommendations for potential uses of HOT funds
 - a. Discuss Community Funding Policy and budget for outcomes [Duke; 55-72]
 - b. Presentation and discussion of scope of proposed compliance audit [Duke; 73-88]
 - c. Discuss report to City Council [Forbus]
 - E. Set date for next meeting [Forbus]
- IV. ADJOURNMENT

CERTIFICATE

I, Stephanie Brim, City Secretary, do hereby certify that a copy of the April 9, 2009 Hotel Occupancy Tax Board Meeting Agenda was posted on the City Hall bulletin board, a place convenient and readily accessible to the general public at all times, in compliance with Chapter 551, Texas Government Code.

DATE OF POSTING: April 3, 2009 TIME OF POSTING: 4:00pm

Stephanie Brim, City Secretary

HOTEL OCCUPANCY TAX BOARD MEETING CITY OF HUNTSVILLE April 9th, 2009

BOARD MEMBERS: CHARLES FORBUS, CHAIRMAN

DICK LINDEMAN, POSITION ONE

WAYNE BARRETT, POSITION TWO

CONNIE HEILAND, POSITION THREE

LANNY D. RAY, POSITION FOUR

KIMM THOMAS, EX-OFFICIO MEMBER

LINDA PEASE, EX-OFFICIO MEMBER

ALSO PRESENT: BILL BAINE, CITY MANAGER

LEONARD SCHNEIDER, CITY ATTORNEY

DEE EVERETT, PRESIDENT, CHAMBER OF

COMMERCE

SHANNON HIGBIE, CHAMBER OF COMMERCE

WINSTON DUKE, AUDITOR, CITY OF

HUNTSVILLE



1 (Proceedings in Council Chamber at 5:30 p.m.) 2 MR. FORBUS: (Inaudible) this session of the hotel occupancy tax board to order on this day 3 April 9th of 2009. We'll start out with reading the minutes of the -- trying to approve the minutes of the February 19th, 2009 meeting. Has anyone -- I'm sorry, this is citizen input. I jumped that, I think. (Inaudible). Does anyone have anything that they would like to --10 MR. RAY: Who is logging our minutes 11 tonight? 12 MR. FORBUS: Who is logging the minutes tonight? I guess the Free Press is logging the minutes 13 14 tonight. Well, we're recording. 15 MR. RAY: We'll just get the recording. 16 MR. FORBUS: Mr. Baine, who do you have to -- do you have anyone to log the minutes of the 17 meeting tonight? 18 19 MR. BAINE: (Inaudible). 20 MR. FORBUS: Okay. 21 (Discussion) 22 MR. FORBUS: We're waiting for a 23 secretary or someone to take the minutes* for the 24 meeting. We got recorders all over the place so 25 hopefully we'll be able to record everything, but we

would like to have the minutes written down. will give it a few more minutes here while we try to round something on up. (Short Pause) 5 MR. FORBUS: We didn't get any rain 6 today. 7 The day is not over. VOICE: 8 MR. FORBUS: It sure looked like it this morning, though, didn't it? Man. MR. BAINE: Well, let me continue to 10 look. 11 12 MR. FORBUS: Okay. 13 (Discussion) 14 MR. RAY: Why don't we just go ahead. They can pick up enough from that later. 15 16 MR. FORBUS: We are recording so if that push comes to shove we'll just use the recording off of the -- off our recording device. I guess you're going 18 to do the -- take the notes, right, Bill? 19 20 MR. BAINE: Oh, absolutely. 21 MR. FORBUS: Are your pencils sharp? MR. BAINE: Well, I do have the agenda. 22 MR. FORBUS: Okay. 23 24 MR. BAINE: (Inaudible). 25 MR. FORBUS: We'll talk slowly. Okay,

shall we start?

either.

Okay. Agenda Item A, minutes of the February 19th -- approval of the February 19th, 2009 meeting. Does anyone have any input on that? Any discussion of that, of those minutes?

MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah, I do, Mr. Chairman. As I read the last four paragraphs of those minutes they are kind of garbled. And I'm not sure what some of that means. And I don't know if you want to take the time to try to sort it out here or maybe just remand that -- let somebody go back and listen to the tape and see what we actually did say. Because it quotes various people as saying different things in there and I'm not sure that's the way I heard it and I'm not sure what this means.

For example, the paragraph that starts

Mr. Ray suggested that the HOT board could report back

to the counsel, that the city could finance about a

100K out of general funds and other funding

approximately 100K out of HOT funds for historical

preservation putting the WHAC budget about a hundred

thousand dollars short. That math isn't right, I don't

think.

MR. RAY: No. And I didn't say that,

MR. BAINE: I think I probably said that.

11 l

15 l

19 l

21 l

23 l

MR. RAY: I think you said that.

MR. FORBUS: Okay. We will pass on the approval of the minutes and get a better recording of what was said that night. So we'll move on to agenda Item B.

Review and discussion comptrollers's presentation of March 19th work session. I've got a few things that I want to say about that. And I will start off and then I will yield the floor to any other board members.

First thing I remember, I want to stress is that presenter, (inaudible) <u>Gillihan</u> said, and he must have said it numerous times, that the basic criteria for using HOT money was heads and beds. And I think that we can use the money on various things like arts, historical events, but they also have to tie to heads and beds.

The second thing that I want to mention is tourists versus hotel occupancy tax tourists. A tourist is anyone who comes to town and spends the money, and we appreciate those people and we appreciate whatever advice, whatever information that brings those folks to town. But to spend the hotel occupancy tax

money we have to address tourists that come to spend the night, put the heads in the beds, so that was the second thing I wanted to bring.

The third thing is the need for -- to have hotels help certify tourist events, correlation to heads and beds and tourist events that bring those heads to beds. So I think one of the things that our comptroller presenter said was we need to get with the hotel industry and have some kind of questionnaire, documentation that why did you come to town? Did you come to town for an event? Is that why you're spending the night? That's one way to really have an accurate tally of who is coming to town and if they are spending the night for the events.

1.4

The other thing that I got out of it was the jeopardy of legal action relating from misuse or perceived misuse of funds. So we got to be very careful. I understand a hotelier or even a city that feels that these funds are not being used correctly can go down and put a cease and desist order in and that the city is going to have to prove that those funds are spent correctly. So that is another issue that we need to be very aware of using the hotel funds.

 have a representative on the HOT Board from the hotel industry. They have a vested interest in how this money is spent and how we record it and how the projects work. And so I believe that at the next board appointment I will mention to the Mayor and, in fact, on my report to counsel that we need to address this issue, that we do need a representative or even two from the hotel industry. I've said about all I have to say about it. Other board members have any input on the presentation by the comptrollers office?

MS. HEILAND: In addition to those take a ways, Charles, it was very clear to me several times it was mentioned that there must be criteria established, communicated and abided by before you spend any money on any other projects. And I think we have that in our contract. But we need to make sure that we look at any sort of contracting arrangement to have those guidelines and criteria. And they have to basically -- anybody that applies for this money has to be able to show what they are going to do and then they also have to demonstrate how they are going to measure it. And at the end of that term you have the measurements given. So it is quantifiable measurements are also. That's what I heard a lot of.

The other thing that I thought was very

```
important to remember is that because HOT money cannot
   be used for a particular purpose, like the arts or even
   historic preservation if it doesn't meet the guidelines
   stated very clearly in the statute, there are other
   sources of money available, or that can be used.
   so that was a constant theme throughout that I think we
   need to (inaudible).
 8
                  MR. FORBUS: Other input?
 9
                  VOICE: Sir, could you get her to speak
10
       Give her a microphone.
   up?
                  MR. FORBUS:
                                She got it.
11
12
                  MS. HEILAND: Hello.
                  MR. FORBUS: Louder.
13
                  MS. HEILAND: I don't want to blow you
14
15
   out of the room.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Are these mics on?
16
17
   you hear me?
                  MR. FORBUS: This one is on.
18
19
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Charles, I had a couple
   more. Are you through, Connie?
20
                  MR. FORBUS: Would you like her to
21
22
   restate that?
                  VOICE:
                          Yes.
                                I couldn't hear a word.
23
                  MS. HEILAND: Okay. What I took away
24
   from the meeting --
25
```

MR. FORBUS: Can you hear now?

VOICE: Yes. Thank you very much.

MS. HEILAND: What I took away from the meeting -- no problem at all. Usually my voice is loud enough to be heard -- is that there have to be criteria presented by the contractee that states exactly how they are going to meet the criteria of the statute that Charles has already talked about and I don't care to go back into that at all again. But there is also other funds that are available and I will add a little bit to this is, you know, the fact that perhaps certain arts funding can't come from HOT funds doesn't mean that there aren't other sources. But that also relates to the fact about how strict we have to interpret this statute. It has to go for the purposes stated there. If it's not then, well, it's illegal.

MR. FORBUS: We can't use it. Okay. Dick, you have more other input?

MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah. Actually I went back and listened to one of these tapes of this meeting several times and these two gentlemen that came had a lot to say. And I wrote down fifteen points, some of which has already been covered and I certainly won't burden the group with them here, but there were a lot of things on there that we really need to consider.

The one that was probably most helpful to me that hasn't been mentioned is the co-mingling business. And that came to us actually from the -- Mr. Gapell, the auditor from the CPA firm in Houston. he said that the criteria that the auditing industry is using to determine co-mingling is when you look at an activity if you can determine what source of funds it If you can determine what source of funds came from. funded that activity it's no co-mingling. But if there is ambiguity as to what the source of fund is for that activity then it is by definition, he said by definition, it is co-mingling. So that strikes me as a fairly practical test we can use to test the State -because the State law is very clear that co-mingling, as we all know, that co-mingling is not allowed. think that's a test that we can use going forward.

1

2

5

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

we need to use the Texas Historical Commission criteria for historical houses. It can't be just an old house. It has to meet the State's requirements. And he suggested, you may recall, that we outsource the gift shop. And normally a city doesn't have more than one visitor's center. I was toying with the idea of having three so he shot me out of the air in a hurry.

MR. FORBUS: I don't think he said we

couldn't have more than one but --

1

2

3

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. RAY: Said he has never seen it.

MR. FORBUS: Usually don't have but one, right. I think we still are in the hunt for another -- for a visitor's center if we want to.

MR. LINDEMAN: And other than that I think you covered it, Mr. Chairman.

MR. FORBUS: Wayne.

MR. BARRETT: Well, I just -- am I on?

MR. BAINE: Yes, sir.

I'm concerned about our MR. BARRETT: funding for Huntsville Arts Commission, which I think is an enriching and important part of Huntsville. And so I would just hope that -- I haven't had time yet myself to try to research this. I hope that maybe some on the Arts Commission can. Just find out what other city in Texas who have had -- who have similar structures as our own, who have the hotel-motel tax and who are funding the arts with that fifteen percent that is permitted, to find out what they may be doing, the ways that they may have found to meet these requirements that we've been made aware of. Perhaps we don't have to reinvent the wheel and there may be some creative ideas out there about what we can do.

I can say from that standpoint of when

you talk about an artistic event, even if it's something like Houston Grand Opera, that doesn't maybe bring in that many people who would stay overnight. They would either live in Houston or even if you drove down from Huntsville to go to something like that you would just come back home. So if the test for every single event is that that event in and of itself has to draw people then that would be, I think, a test that almost any artistic event in the State would fail. Because that is not just a high bar, that is an extraordinarily high bar. But maybe they have found ways to — that events can be, I don't know, linked, promoted in a certain way, joined with other activities. I think we need to just see what other people are doing to be in compliance.

21 l

And the other side is this. A lot of the artistic events that we fund they are very good but they have small budgets and it would be outside the scope of their expertise or their budget for each of these events to be able to even have measurements for everybody who's there, did they spend the night and this, that and the other. So I absolutely am for compliance with the law and the letter and the spirit of it, but I do -- I have to feel that there is a way that other entities have found to meet this requirement

and I just hope that we can be successful in doing that. Because I think that it's an important part of our community. And if we find it that we can't do business as we been doing it and fund the arts let's find a way that we can do it and fund the arts. That's my perspective anyway. And I hope that we'll be successful in doing that.

VOICE: (Inaudible).

MR. FORBUS: Yes. And I believe that -I don't believe anyone on this Board is anti the arts.
I believe we all believe that the arts are very
important and that we need to bring in the young people
to expose them to the arts so it does make a difference
in their lives. But there may be a necessity to search
for other funding in that area. So we just have to see
what we can come up with on that. Does anyone else
have any input here?

MR. LINDEMAN: Well, I say one more on my list here, Charlie, that we didn't mention and that is that he said that it was legitimate to use HOT funds to pay for city expenses. People in the city that are working to promote heads and beds can be paid for out of HOT funds and we discovered a case in Conroe where apparently they are paying someone, if not full time, a substantial period of their time, out of HOT funds

because that person is working with their arts commission to promote those activities. So that's another thing I think we should note going forward.

MR. FORBUS: I think we about covered the --

MR. RAY: Ms. Thomas was there. Maybe she has some input.

MR. FORBUS: Kimm, do you have anything you would like to add?

MS. THOMAS: Not at this time.

MR. FORBUS: And before we get going any further I want ya'll to understand that this is an information session. It's not an adversarial situation where we are wanting to do anything so far as taking this funding away from anybody. The main thing that I feel that we need to do is be very transparent with the money that we are using because this is actually citizens' money, the hotel industry's money, and that we need to be very clear. Everyone should know what the money is being spent for, how it is being spent and if we can do a better job somehow I think we need to do that. Because basically we want to try to stimulate the economy of Huntsville. And so if anyone has any opinions that don't jive with what we're -- this board is saying, please feel free after we discuss these

things to voice your opinions. We will present them -excuse me, I will present them to the counsel and -the pollen is killing me by the way. But I will visit
them with the counsel, both sides of any argument, so
feel free to express your opinion after we get through
discussing these issues.

And so we move to Item C, which is usage and accountability of HOT funds by the Huntsville-Walker County Chamber of Commerce as a tax code Chapter 351 delegated entity.

MR. RAY: I think sub A is the Chamber's presentation.

MR. FORBUS: If you do have something that you would like to say please come to the microphone and so we can record (inaudible).

MS. THOMAS: Good evening. First of all I want to thank the Board for allowing us the opportunity to come before you and to share what it is that we do on a daily basis. One of the points that I want to make beginning this is that, you know, in the beginning we had talked about doing an actual workshop. This is by no means that workshop. There is no way that we can share all of that information in this appointed time.

One thing I do want to share with you is

6 l

a little bit about myself since I am the one who's ultimately responsible for the tourism funds as relates to the Chamber of Commerce.

I have (inaudible) in the hospitality hotel industry. When I moved to Huntsville I managed the LaQuinta and immediately became involved in the convention and visitors bureau because I realized the importance of having that within the city and being active with it as a hotelier. By saying that I want you to also know that I understand the importance of putting head in beds, if you will. I work very closely with the hoteliers. We do visit them between myself and Jamie on a regular basis at least once a month. And I just wanted to make sure that you guys are aware of my background and where I came from.

Our presentation, the overview of the presentation we are going to look at the general advertising marketing, the media advertising; print, radio and internet, association programs, our partnerships, the trade shows and exhibitions that we go to, exhibits. We are going to also look at group bookings and servicing. I want to bring to your attention that upon seeing that we were going to be able to present a presentation I did contact Mr. Forbus and asked what direction he wanted me to go with the

presentation. And this is pretty much the direction in which he pointed me. Group bookings and servicing was one of the key issues that he was really concerned with and he has brought that to my attention on a couple of occasions. We're going to talk about group booking process, sample listing of the groups and the city comparison. And there is four cities involved in that comparison.

One of the important things to mention is that is the Chamber mission. The Huntsville-Walker County Chamber of Commerce is a member and community service organization that develops, promotes — and promotes businesses, leadership and tourism for the enrichment of our quality of life and the local economy. We are proud to have this partnership with the city as it relates to tourism.

Our general advertising -- I apologize that is kind of going off the screen. Can you adjust that? Okay. Right now this is based on our budget for '08 and '09. Our budget was \$45,000 in this particular area. It have a listing there of the different things in which we do advertise with and that is our annual events brochure. We have the visitor (inaudible) for those of you who are in budget we gave you a binder that had all just about all of our information in that.

That is included. Mr. Lindeman and Connie received theirs today. Did you get your copy?

1

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. LINDEMAN: Yes, ma'am.

MS. THOMAS: Okay. You will have these brochures in all of that and your binder for you to look at and for those of you that have already received it.

Now, I want to say something as it relates to -- and I'm going to actually read it from what cities need to know to administer the local hotel occupancy tax. And this is coming from criteria one. And this is on the Attorney General's web site as well as the hotel-motel lodging association. But it reads in criteria one, which we know it says that it must directly enhance, promote tourism and convention and hotel industry. However, when you read through that -and this might help some, Mr. Ray, in which you were speaking of just a few minutes ago. It says tourism is defined under state law as bringing visitors from outside of the city from a different city or county into the city or its vicinity. It goes on to state with regards to the second problem of criteria one, state law does not specifically define what constitute direct promotion and convention and hotel industry. However, this requirement has been consistently

interpreted by the Attorney Generals in this

(inaudible) section by the Texas Municipal League, they
have historically indicated that to directly promote
the convention and hotel industry, the event or
facility must be likely to cause increased hotel or
convention activity. And I think this will help in
regard to what you were talking about because it says
must be likely. And in a lot of these events and a lot
of the things that we do in this community more than
likely can promote that for us.

MR. RAY: I'm sorry, excuse me.

MS. THOMAS: Yes.

MR. RAY: Are you disagreeing that it has to be the heads and beds thing?

MS. THOMAS: I'm not disagreeing with that. What I'm saying is that this gives us a little clearer picture. Because all communities in the State of Texas -- we have more small communities than a lot of states.

MR. RAY: Right.

MS. THOMAS: And because of that it's, like he was saying, it's hard to qualify that. It's really, really hard to qualify that. If you call just about any small community based on our size or even some a little bit larger they will tell you that it is

hard to qualify the head and beds.

MR. RAY: I agree with you the substantia problem they told us we have to do is challenging it.

MS. THOMAS: Uh-huh.

MR. RAY: At least. But as far as what the money can be used for, I think it is now undeniably crystal clear it's got to be tourism and the hotel industry. And while the definition of tourism is the one you just recited and it's accurate, where they get that from is the use of tax revenue, the law, 351.101, that says it may be used only to promote tourism and the convention and hotel industry. And it's the "and" in there that we got tripped up on or that you we are all hooked with.

MS. THOMAS: Uh-huh.

MR. RAY: And that's why I don't think there is any room to maneuver trying to say we are doing day trippers anymore. Do you agree with all of that?

MR. THOMAS: I think -- what I'm pointing to is the definition that they give in here, and that is the event or facility must be likely to cause increase. We can have an event -- and the comptroller even spoke about this -- you know, the

first year we have an event we might not know until after that event take place whether or not it's going to cause head and beds. But going forward we know the next year, looking at that event, whether or not it's going to happen. But we have to use this test here, must be likely to cause increased hotel and convention activity. And I truly believe that this is part of, especially for the smaller communities, is our test for, you know, making sure we on the right track as well as it relates to our advertising and things of that nature.

MS. HEILAND: May I interject? Reading through a lot of the material I circled the fact that yes, that perhaps is a word that can be used. But it has to be tied with substantiation. And it's often said, I don't know how many times with our speaker, that a first time event it's a guess.

MS. THOMAS: Right.

again then it seems to me there is more of a burden to actually document through again connections with the hotel industry, which I thought was very interesting in that our speaker said these guys really know, you know, who's staying in town and they'll be eager to help.

And so guest registries, there are several different

means that don't seem unduly burdensome. And I guess hopefully in your presentation you will say what efforts have been made in the past to do that. But it seems to me that that is one of the things that is probably going to be needed to look more into.

MS. THOMAS: I agree with you. And that is something that is needed. And we have been talking with the hotels. One thing that we have to understand is we have to understand those that we are dealing with as relates to our hotels here in the city. We have a couple of hotels that are very eager and willing to give us that information. On the other hand, we have hotels that never provides the information. And in my going forward you will see where we mention about working harder to secure that information.

MR. FORBUS: Yes. I just was going to interject one thing. I think tourism, day tourists, whatever, they are very important. And whatever kind of tourism you can bring to town, if it's just for the day, that's great. But I would think that that is probably part of the Chamber's mission to help stimulate business in Huntsville through bringing tourists to town, people from out of town for nothing else eat at the Farm House or eat at the Junction or eat at Chili's or wherever, you know. Or spend money

at downtown on the square. But, again, we got to get back to the fact that the hotel occupancy money needs to be and -- and that's a big and, bring heads to beds. I think any kind of tourism is great, but we got to focus on the heads and beds.

23 l

MS. THOMAS: And I understand that. And one thing about the day trippers, if you will -- and I have sat out at the statute many of times in the visitors center there who we had a guest that stopped through and upon stopping realized -- and it was a day tripper, but they didn't necessarily come in to see what all we had to offer but they stopped there, received information and said I did not know Huntsville had so much to offer. I will be back, you know. And in our advertising we also have to take into account those individuals who might just necessarily be a day tripper but also can, you know, turn into an overnight stay as well. And I understand what you're saying.

MR. FORBUS: I'm not saying that the people out at the statute need to tie peoples' arms behind their back and say you need to spend the night in town. But even if you send them downtown so they can shop around, look around, see our downtown, I think that is a great way to influence people and maybe bring them back so they do spend the night. That's all I was

saying. I think that that is a mission that everybody 1 in this town should be trying to help stimulate our business events pocket books. 3 4 MS. THOMAS: So I have you on board in 5 getting the whole community involved. 6 MR. FORBUS: Absolutely, absolutely. 7 (Short pause) MR. FORBUS: Use the up key. 8 MS. THOMAS: That's the corner there. 9 MR. FORBUS: Kick it. 10 MS. THOMAS: I can't reach that high. 11 When I was in high school I could. Did you guys change 12 the battery? 13 MR. BAINE: Here it is. 14 15 MR. FORBUS: There it goes. MS. THOMAS: Okay. Go back one more 16 back to that other page. Okay. This is a little hard 17 to read but I will make copies for you and have for you 18 at a later date. But on here this is our media PR 19 coverage. And the first column there gives you kind of 20 an insight on the circulation of some of the 21 publications that we actually advertise with. 22 Texas Monthly do over three hundred 23 thousand in circulation. Hotel Display Show Case, 24 25 Triple A Home and Away magazine do two-hundred fifteen

This was just a sampling of, you know, some thousand. of the circulation that we received. And one of the things that we do in our advertising and that is our branding. You know, Sam Houston statue is one of the most recognized statues in the world. We include him on there. We also share a logo with the city, the Chamber and with the Convention and Visitors Bureau and that is the State of Texas with Huntsville in there as part or our branding. One of the things about branding is that the more they see it the more inclined they are to investigate and find out more information and, therefore, go to the web site and things of that nature and find out what we have to offer. This is two of the brochures that we currently use on a regular basis. This brochure is located just about everywhere throughout the city.

11

2

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

You mentioned the different visitors centers. The Wynne home have them, Main Street have them, Sam Houston Visitors Center have them, the Hearts Veterans Museum have them. I can go on from there.

The CJ Center at the university have them. We get requests on a daily basis for these particular ones.

One of the ones that I do not have up here is the (inaudible). That's another very popular publication, if you will, that we have for guests when they are

entering the city or that we mail out to perspective visitors and groups.

Some of the different advertising things that we use are promotional things. At the bottom left hand corner there is a postcard there that have (inaudible). We have caps. We have all different types of things; pens, cups, book markers for the kids when they come out there that gives all the information on Huntsville. That's just some of the marketing things that we do.

Now, one of the things about the particular items that we have here, the university is really, really good at utilizing this. When they have major groups coming in, the meeting planners and things of that nature, they usually call and ask for gift baskets and things for those who are planning the meeting so that, you know, they have all the information on Huntsville and we utilize these things for them. Some of the bill boards that -- all of the bill boards that we have out at this particular time, the newest one is the one at the very top, step into history, Huntsville is big on heroes, tapping into our Hearts Veterans Museum, antiques and ice cream is our historic square. And, again, step into history, which is traveling from north here. Media advertising,

1 print, radio and internet. And, again, it lists all of the different things that we do, who we advertise with. And the three markets that we basically concentrate on is Texas, Louisiana and Oklahoma. Some examples of the ads.

3

4

5

6

9

10

111

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Visitor inquiry and web services. particular year we did a focus towards our internet to make sure that we brought our web sites up to speed. We are currently in the process of getting that completed now. One of the things that we have noticed -- and if you remember correctly during the budget process we left pretty much all of the advertising, everything pretty much flat to what it was the previous year. And we increased on our web services and inquiries so that we can have that penetration in the market.

Mail responses. Advertising generates inquiries and we follow-up by mailing information. Below is an example of some of our tracking. See Texas first, spring and fall. We mailed out over eight thousand inquiries, okay? And this is just a sampling But the total mailed out for the year 2007-08 of them. we did over eleven thousand two-hundred fifty-seven inquiry mail outs.

Association and co-op programs that we

are currently involved in. TTIA, Texas Travel Industry Association, TACVB, Texas Association of Convention and Visitors Bureau, just to name a few. These are some of the partnerships that we are involved in. Texas Forest With these partnerships, you know, we have a Trail. presence there. So we are on their web sites. in their publications. We, you know, wherever they are They go to trade shows, they represent us we are. there as well. And the same with our other partnerships with Texas Department of Transportation. They have their own web site and they work very closely with Texas Hotel Lodging Association. And the Office of the Governor, you know, they have an economic development and tourism department. One of the reports that I will show you later actually came from the Governor's Office. We do work with them. And they have their own tourism department that goes out and markets Texas and by being involved in their organization we have a presence there as well.

1

3

4

5

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17 l

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Trade shows that we usually go to.

Triple A shows, the Houston Travel Show. We've been to the McAllen Winter Texan show. We try to get to as many of these as possible throughout the year because this is another penetration in the market that allows us to get the word out about Huntsville, whether it is

group bookings, individual travelers, so that we can make sure that our presence is out there.

2

3

4

5

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 l

19

20

21

22

23 **l**

241

25

MS. HEILAND: Excuse me. I saw one down there, the SHSU orientation and recruitment --

MS. THOMAS: Yes. And that -- this is a This past year we -- most of the picture from that. seventeen hundred parents stayed in local hotels here last summer. Last summer was our first time doing it. It really doesn't cost us a whole lot of money, but we get in front of about seventeen hundred parents. showed them the video of Huntsville. Most of them do stay at that particular event because it's orientation for their freshman coming in. Now, the good thing about it is by being there showing them, most of them did not know all that Huntsville has to offer. Hopefully when they come back to move their students in and out of the dorm or to attend an event here they will stay and get the opportunity to see some of the other venues that Huntsville has to offer. And I can actually share, majority of the convention and visitors board, the tourism counsel board, and the Chamber of Commerce boards, executive board and the regular board, and main street participated as well as Sam Houston State University participated and came out and helped us with this event. It was their event. They had

never done anything with it in the past but just let the parents eat and go on their way. We had people there to mingle with them, to share information, to talk about their venue so that they could be, you know, get excited about what all we had to offer as well.

2

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Some examples of the trade shows and how we set up. And there is Jamie there doing what she does best. Huntsville as a destination. I touched on But one thing we have to this a little bit earlier. understand, and I know the focus is the heads and beds and group activity. Huntsville, we have eight hundred and fifty-three total hotel rooms in inventory here. Out of that eight hundred fifty-three rooms -- and I must speak honestly, about four hundred and seventy of them are really suitable for group bookings. Out of that four hundred and seventy -- and that's from a select group of hotels -- out of that four hundred seventy that is their complete inventory. Nine chances out of ten a hotel is not going to give you -- in fact, I know they are not going to give you their entire inventory of rooms. They are going to give you a percentage of their rooms. So if we take that and divide it in half we have very few rooms to focus on. As we grow and as we get better in policing our hotels and making sure they are up to standard then this

number will grow and the more we'll be able to book and produce better rooms. I'm not saying that we don't try to do that now. What I'm saying is this is the state of Huntsville at this particular time and as we grow, I mean the groupings bookings will grow as well. We have limited meeting space within the hotels and outside of the hotels. We now have on board, which we are glad to have, the FEMA shelter. And I'm sorry I should have put the correct verbiage, the Veteran's Conference Center there. We have that now but it is still limited in what we are able to do there because should there be some type of --

MR. FORBUS: Event.

MR. THOMAS: Not event but emergency, then we will have to displace that group.

MR. FORBUS: Would may be displaced anyway. If we had a hurricane you think they would come here?

MS. THOMAS: Well, this is a situation.

If the disaster is over in Corpus they going to

evacuate Corpus to come to Huntsville. So we might not

even be threatened by that disaster yet we will have to

vacate that group. And one of the things about groups,

once you make a group angry, just like if you make a

person angry, that person tells one person, that group

tells another group, and it's a domino effect from there. And one thing we don't want to -- I'm all for 2 booking the convention center. I just want to make 3 sure that we understand, you know, the limitations there. We were just out there, Dee MR. FORBUS: 6 and a bunch of us were out there yesterday, wasn't it? 7 Time flies. But it's a nice facility. Yeah. really nice. 9 MS. THOMAS: It's beautiful. And they 10 11 have done a great job with decorating it. MR. FORBUS: That would be a great place 12 to host a conference if we had some way to transport 13 people. And maybe we could do something like that. 14 George and I were talking about maybe having a trolly 15 system that would go around to the hotels and bring 16 people out there to the convention center. That's an 17 idea we might float later. But I'll stop. 18 MS. THOMAS: Make sure I'm included on 19 that one. 20 What's the capacity --MR. RAY: 21 MR. BARRETT: I just might reinforce. 22 I'm assuming this is right, but the situation you face 23 with just certain rooms being suitable for booking a 24

group because if you did book a group and you

25

```
encouraged them to stay at a place where they had a
1
   negative experience you will have an anti-tourism
2
   effect because they would hold that against you and
3
   they would associate that experience with coming to
   Huntsville for a convention.
5
                  MS. THOMAS: Exactly.
6
7
                  MR. BARRETT:
                                 So you do have to be
   careful what you recommend to groups coming in as far
8
   as where they might stay, I would think.
                  MS. THOMAS:
                                I will say that the last
10
   two years we have had two fabulous hotels that have
11
   come on board and that's included in that number,
12
   though.
13
                             What is the capacity of the
                  MR. RAY:
14
   shelter for a convention, conferences?
15
                  MS. THOMAS:
                                I apologize. I don't know
16
   right off hand. But Richie has -- what to is the
17
   total?
18
19
                  VOICE:
                           Eight hundred.
                                Eight hundred. And that is
                  MS. THOMAS:
20
   the -- I mean, general session still or --
21
22
                  VOICE:
                          Yeah.
                                  Between five and eight
   hundred people, sit down dinner.
23
                                There are four break away
                  MR. FORBUS:
24
25
   areas.
```

MS. THOMAS: Other meeting facility -and I thought I would bring this to your attention.

Now, I do not have Sam Houston State listed in here
because that's another variable. They can only book so
far out and then if something comes up that the
university needs it for, guess what, you're displacing
another group.

Other meeting facilities is the Walker Education Center, the Wynne home, Magnolia Lakes, Samuel Walker Houston Cultural Center, Walker County Fairgrounds, the Texas Prison Museum and the State Park Lodge. Yeah, we do have some other ones, that's just a sampling of what we do have.

And then the third issue would be transportation. If we bring a group here, let's say we had a group of fifty or more and they had an event, most of them don't like to drive. They usually like to stay within their host hotel. That's another situation. If we had a group that we brought to town, let's say fifty to seventy-five attendees, and they had a meeting, okay? They had a general session, which is where they all gathered for just an overview, then they need a break out room to go to individual committee meetings and things of that nature, then they had a dinner, where would we put them? So then they are

looked -- forced to go outside of the hotel to do this.

And then in doing so they usually like to travel together as a group. They don't want to have to take all their individual cars and things of that nature.

VOICE: Would you pull the mic up?

MS. THOMAS: Is that better?

VOICE: Yes.

MS. THOMAS: Okay. So then transportation becomes a problem. So there are different things that, you know, we have to look at when we are looking at bringing group bookings into the area.

Sampling of some of the groups that have stayed with us here with us. Now, a lot of times and what is really becoming more common, rather than having a meeting planner and do all of this for them a lot of times there is someone from a particular department that's handling the meeting. And to be honest with you they don't want to handle the hotel rooms. They don't want to — they want a list of where to stay and then at that point they give that to their attendees and say you're on your own, make your reservation, your stipend is this. But this is the sampling of groups and conferences that we did service last year. Sam Houston State worked very well with us in informing us of the

```
things they have coming in as well as TDCJ, Region Six.
   They are very, very comfortable, I think, with us in
 3
   insuring that we get the information to them that they
 4
   need and working with them on their groups when they
 5
   bring them to town.
                         Mr. Forbus?
 6
                   MR. FORBUS: I was just going to say
 7
   most of those were set up by the various -- like SHSU
 8
   and Region Six and TDCJ --
 9
                   MS. THOMAS: Yes. Majority of them are
10
   set up.
                   MR. FORBUS:
                               They are already set up by
11
12
   them and you went out and worked with the
   organizations, right?
13
                   MS. THOMAS:
                               Yes.
14
15
                   MR. FORBUS:
                               Okay.
16
                   MS. THOMAS:
                               They contact us and we do
17
   work with them.
18
                  MR. FORBUS:
                               But they were coming
19
   anyway, right?
20
                  MS. THOMAS:
                               Yes.
                                      More than likely the
21
   university arranged for the group to come here. But to
22
   give up one example. This year we had the -- excuse me
23
   if I don't have the correct name, the group that's
24
   coming past, and they had over three hundred people
   that stayed in and around Huntsville and did sell out a
25
```

couple of hotels. And that was the -- it was the students --

MR. FORBUS: Non-violent --

MS. THOMAS: No. It was actually for special ed students, program for special ed students and parents. And I found them in a newspaper outside of Huntsville. That's how I found out about them, called them, contacted them to let them know what we could do to help them with a group. And in doing so — and we have done this with several groups, in doing so not only did we help them with, you know, making sure that their meeting was a success, we also made sure that they had a welcome sign for the group when they walked through the door, you know, things of that nature to make sure that that group felt welcome here and hopefully by doing so they will rebook with us.

MR. FORBUS: What other -- can you name some other groups that you have brought to town besides that one?

MS. THOMAS: Right now we are actually -- well, that I have actually brought to town?

MR. FORBUS: No. That the CVB brought

23 to town. I mean just --

MS. THOMAS: In the past we have brought -- I don't know if you were here then. We had

the women on wheels. It was a biker group that came through. There are several different one. I can't think of anything right off hand right now. For the most part we help the service groups. Right now we are actually working on a very fantastic group, the Texas Liceum, and I don't know if you're familiar with them but they are coming in August. And we do things like tours that came in to do a site visit of the town. We took them on a tour. We showed them the different hotels. They're in the process of selecting where they want to stay and all of that. But in doing so they are coming. They might contact us but we do everything we can to make sure that they do book with us.

MS. HEILAND: And how do you -- can you hear me?

MS. THOMAS: Yes.

MS. HEILAND: How do you get those leads? You said you found one in a newspaper ad and that type of thing. But what has been your process to try to get new groups into town?

MS. THOMAS: There's different processes that you can utilize. There are different search engines that you can go into. TSCVB, which is one of our organizations that we belong to, they have a program called Tex-Met. I just recently went in and

did a search on military reunions. And actually the good thing about this particular search engine is that you can go in and see what type of pickup they have so you can know if it would be a good fit for your group. You see what type of meeting space. It's already been qualified as a group and you can pull that information off. So that's one reason -- one way for an event.

This is our current page on our web site. It's a meeting planner page. And in there it lists all of the different things -- and I will pass this around so that you can get a little bit better look of it -- I mean at it. But it tells all of the different things. And this is actually on our web site. And most meeting planners do go to the web site and pull this type of information off. And they will contact you about booking groups. But it does tell all of the different things that we have to offer in the way of helping them with their groups. I will pass this around.

This is a note, one of the examples I gave is about the university contacting us. This is from Greg Kinsey who had the National Junior College Association who was looking at us to come in and do an event here. Unfortunately we lost it because we did not have the meeting capacity to accommodate them. But

normally he would contact us. My first response usually is this, their requests for proposal so that we can find out what their needs are because that is usually what is included in there. This particular group did not have one but stated their information, what they needed. We replied back. Unfortunately, again, we lost the group.

1 |

This is a call sheet that is at our front desk at the Chamber. Chris usually is the first contact when you walk in. When they are coming in looking for information about -- and the first thing they want is the give-mes. Give me, what do you have? What bags do you have? What can we give to our groups? And the first thing we usually try to do and that is to qualify them. There is a section on there that says have you booked hotel rooms? How many? What hotels? This particular one said that they had not and at the bottom they asked if we could help them in doing so and we did.

This is an example of a letter of agreement that was sent to a hotel that was filled out and sent back to us saying what they can do, what rooms that they could book for this particular group. They sign it, they send it back to us, therefore, we have it on file to give to the meeting planner. This a similar

letter as well. And this one actually is thanking them for their commitment because this one was actually done over the phone rather than a letter.

to know right then. You talk to them on the phone and then I follow-up with a letter saying thank you for your commitment, can you please fill this out to make sure that we do have something on file for you. And then this is a confirmation that I have actually sent out that usually we have someone that has booked a group with us, I send them back a confirmation on what the hotels have committed to so they can have a grid of all the hotels, how many rooms they have all on one page.

Now, this is a sponsorship that we actually did this year. And we've been doing it for a couple of years. Now, this is Huntsville Baseball Association. And we help them by sponsorship. And the reason why we do that is because this past weekend -- I don't know if you noticed -- the Kate Barr Ross park was full of Little Leaguers and it was a tournament there. And we actually called around to get hotel rooms for them. And this is one way of helping them with their events so that we they bring more people in. And they have four more tournaments scheduled for this

year.

Conference marketing and servicing. And this is back to the postage and everything and how we service groups. The different things that we do and mail out for them.

Travel spending comparison by city. And I mentioned this to you earlier and I included four cities here including us; Nacogdoches, Conroe and Brenham. And as you can see, this is the city level. Normally we give you what the county level is of spending. And this is total travel spending. I'm not saying this is head and beds, this is total travel spending. And we are actually at ninety million for the entire county. But for Huntsville by itself, the travel spending is seventy million dollars. And as you can see Conroe is at the bottom here is forty-eight and these are all compatible to our market. We have Nacogdoches, which is at sixty, and then Brenham which is at sixty-five.

MR. FORBUS: That's -- excuse me, that's like gasoline bought on the freeway and --

MS. THOMAS: That's anything as it relates to travel spending, anything. Retail, it can be restaurants, it can be --

MR. FORBUS: Would that be restaurants

```
in town or --
1
                  MS. THOMAS: In town, in the city.
2
   That's actually in the City of Huntsville. Doesn't
3
   have anything to do with the county.
                  MR. FORBUS: Okay. So that's -- how do
5
   you break out travel, people that are traveling from
6
   local people who stop at a restaurant? How is that
   figured out?
                  MS. THOMAS: I would have to go back and
9
   (inaudible) -- zip code.
10
                               So all of this is off of
                  MR. FORBUS:
11
   credit cards?
12
                               This is done in the
                  MS. THOMAS:
13
   Governor's Office.
14
                  MR. FORBUS: This is off of credit
15
16
   cards?
                  MS. THOMAS:
                                No.
17
                  MR. RAY: Is this the Runyon report?
18
                  MS. THOMAS:
                                I'm sorry?
19
                  MR. RAY: Is this the Runyon Report?
20
                                This is a new section of
                  MS. THOMAS:
21
   the Dean Runyon report that just recently came out.
22
   It's only been out a couple of months where they can
23
   break it down by the city. Normally we give it to you
24
   by Walker County. But we contacted the Governor's
25
```

Office and this is what they presented for us. And you can go on to their web site and I can provide that web site for you if you want and take a look at it for yourself.

MR. FORBUS: I was just wondering how cash is -- people go to McDonald's they don't usually use a credit card. I don't know --

MS. THOMAS: To be honest I would have to go back and read the report to really break it out. But it is on the Governor's web site, too, that tells you how they come up with these numbers.

MR. RAY: You're talking it is broken out by zip code as in the point of sale, not the point of origin of the purchaser, correct?

MS. THOMAS: Yes.

MR. RAY: So it doesn't matter. You can't tell where they are coming from. So it's the same muddled information as before. There is no way -- I haven't seen any way to split it out and I don't think you guys have.

MS. THOMAS: I will say this, I know there is a lot of questions as it relates to this report. However, this is the report which comes from the Governor's Office which the State of Texas is governed by. You know, this is the reporting mechanism

that not only Huntsville but all of the different communities and counties actually refer to as it 2 relates to spending and things of that nature. 3 MR. FORBUS: Not questioning -- I'm not 4 questioning that. I think it's a good report. I think 5 it is very good information. I think it is very 6 important to the city to realize that we're -- seventy million dollars being spent here in Huntsville on gas, 8 food, whatever. That's good information for the city 9 to know that that money is being spent here. 10 whether it is being spent by travelers and or being 11 spent by local folks it's hard to determine. But yes, 12 that's good information, I agree. 13 MS. THOMAS: Of the following 14 communities listed in the chart Huntsville has the most 15 growth in the one year period from '07 to '08 and that 16 was ten point three five percent. 17 MR. RAY: Don't you think that is 18 because we built some hotels? 19 MR. FORBUS: Two hotels, two nice ones. 20 MR. RAY: Or is this a pure rate or is 21 this a rate per capita? 22 I would say it's because we MS. THOMAS: 23 do a great job of marketing Huntsville. 24 MR. BAINE: You don't think it has 25

anything to do with the university's law programs where they bring in all of the legal -- all of the police type people on the weekends?

MS. THOMAS: It's a combination of everything.

23 l

MR. BARRETT: I might just mention and I'm not a statistician. But when you do build two new hotels and your occupancy rate goes up that's an indicator I would think that you didn't have enough hotel space.

MS. THOMAS: Exactly.

MR. BARRETT: You would think if you over saturated the market, if you built new hotels my first instinct might be to go oh-oh, I wonder if the occupancy rates are going to dip before you they go up. But if you build two new hotels and the occupancy rate goes up then it seems to be a very positive sign that the city could stand to have even more. You haven't reached your saturation point yet. I'm out of my (inaudible).

MS. THOMAS: One of the other things as it relates to those four cities -- I won't get into all of this and I will make sure you have a copy of this, but this shows what you their market consists of, whether or not they have a conventions center, and I

think -- this information is invaluable, too. But it would tell you whether or not they have a convention center, what their tourist destinations are, what brings people to town based on those numbers that we presented before.

Now, going forward. One of the things that I think is most important in going forward from here is the communication. A great dialogue between the city, the CVB and the Chamber of Commerce. We want to -- we want you to know everything that we do and the results we create. Tracking appears to be a vital part of communication which Connie adhered to -- I mean referred to earlier, to be a vital part of the communication process. And we will revamp our tracking efforts to insure that we are gathering enough information in our reporting to the city. And we will focus more on group booking. The HOT tax is only one percent of the overall city revenue but it develops economic -- and we got from your budget on your web site. It develops economic benefits for the entire (inaudible). We are proud to partner with the city in enhancing and promoting tourism and the convention and hotel industry. And I have to say that I am very proud as an individual to be (inaudible).

MR. FORBUS: Well, we thank you.

25

1

2

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

MS. MONDAY: Charles, can I ask Kimm to clarify one thing, maybe? Kimm, would you speak to the importance of indoor rooms versus outdoor rooms? I'm sure you're all aware of that and if you're not it's a critical thing for the hotel-motel industry.

1

2

3

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

231

24

25

MS. THOMAS: Thank you, Ms. Monday. That is so vital. And that was taken into account when I talked about the qualified rooms for group bookings. Safety issues are very, very important to those who are traveling. And when you have more outside corridor rooms than you do inside corridor rooms less likely are they to book with you. And that's one of the issues that we do have here. The hotels, we have all inside corridors. But all of the remaining hotels -- what we have -- let me restate that. We have other hotels that have inside corridors. However, we have to be careful in our selection of them. And the other one that would be important in that inventory would be the CJ Hotel at the university. But, again, unfortunately, the booking there -- I mean the limitations there are high. there any other questions?

VOICE: One thing, Kimm, whenever you were doing your comparison, Mr. Baine mentioned that Sam Houston State had something to do with the hotels and everything. How many of the other towns have

colleges that were in that comparison?

23 l

MS. THOMAS: Nacogdoches have a college and Brenham have Blinn Junior College.

MR. BAINE: Our university has a very active law enforcement business. Talking to the hotel guys that's what they tell me is one of the reasons they have such good occupancy rates on the weekends.

MR. FORBUS: And Nacogdoches has a good forestry program being an old lumberjack myself.

MS. THOMAS: Why do you think I included that in the (inaudible)?

MR. FORBUS: Number D on this is questions and answers on submitted documentation and report. I was at the CVB meeting yesterday morning and I was asked if the reports looked fine and I said it looked okay to me but I'm not a financial guy. So after I got back I got home on my motorcycle -- because my car is in the shop, I think I have told everyone that, I got some e-mails asking -- saying that they had some concerns about (inaudible) so at this point there are probably some of the board members are going to request a little more in depth information. And I might myself but -- I think -- one question was about the, I know at the CVB board meeting there was a question about requesting information about the

Chamber's financial documents. And I responded that I wasn't a lawyer, that I would let our city attorney answer that question. And believe me I'm glad to off load it on him. So if the other members of the board have questions regarding the documents please start now.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I will start, Mr. Chairman. MR. RAY: think I was the one behind pushing this a little bit. These -- to catch everybody up, we are dealing with hotel occupancy tax here. This is tax dollars. legal requirements from the State, as we learned last time, are extremely strict. You could have read it before that and known that. And anytime you delegate these funds to an entity, such as the Chamber, there are some very strict statutory guidelines that kick in. We do have a contract regarding this and it mirrors the statute almost perfectly. And in some areas it is actually more strict. And this HOT Board was formed in part to determine compliance and accountability. And I'm glad you said you want us to see everything you're doing and communications. And we've been quite frustrated in the communication department determining compliance and accountability and what this money is being used for. And the monthly reports there are some interesting entrees. And we've asked questions and

we've gotten multiple answers for the same questions. 1 So we thought it best if we just asked for the actual documents, themselves, so that we could do the math, match up the invoices. Because the only reports we've gotten so far are self-generated in someone's Quick Books or something somebody generated over at the Chamber. We haven't gotten the actual documents, themselves. I know Mr. Duke has asked for invoices, and it's not that he is being a pest or that we are micro managing, it is the same exact level of detail that is required for any other tax dollar the city spends. And Mr. Duke believes, as did the comptroller, that these funds require the same level. And you don't have to believe me. The law, itself, states that any delegated entity, along with you may not co-mingle it with any other money -- and by the way the law and the statute both create a fiduciary duty. So you're holding these funds as a fiduciary, which is the highest duty under the law. It says you must maintain complete and accurate financial records of each expenditure. That's not here is our advertising budget, here is our in-house budget. Each expenditure, Billy Bob's bill board service, three hundred ninety-five dollars a month, here is the November invoice. That's the detail Mr. Winston has been asking

2

3

4

5

6

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

for and hasn't gotten. And it goes on to say on 1 request of the governing body of the municipality or 2 any other person, shall make these records available 3 for inspection and review. And the contract is a 4 little tighter. It says the Chamber agrees to maintain 5 complete and accurate financial record of each expenditure of hotel occupancy tax revenue made by it. And the very next paragraph, the Chamber agrees to make all financial records related to hotel occupancy tax available for inspection and review or any other 10 person. And later says shall promptly produce such 11 information. 12 So we asked, city letterhead, dear Ms. 1.3

Everett, in preparation for the HOT Board meeting, et cetera, et cetera, please provide the following. The first one; ledgers, accounts, statements, books, et cetera, for all managed HOT fund accounts for 2006, '07 and'08. Did we get those?

MS. THOMAS: Can you hear me? It was my understanding that everything was submitted to you. It was brought over to Stephanie Brim --

MR. RAY: Did it look about this thick?

MS. THOMAS: It was thicker than that.

MR. RAY: Where is the rest of it?

MS. THOMAS: I have no idea.

25

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

MR. RAY: Mine is all in one book. 1 MR. FORBUS: Mine is all in one book. 2 MR. RAY: Let we get to another specific 3 one. The very next line, all associated bank statements containing HOT funds. Did we get that? 5 MS. THOMAS: Yes, sir. 6 MR. RAY: Would you show me one? 7 8 MS. EVERETT: I'm sorry, Mr. Ray. No, we did not get the bank statements because it is our understanding from our bankers on our executive committee that that is -- I mean, you wanted them for 111 the Chamber as well. Those aren't occupancy tax funds. And we had our --13 MR. RAY: Let me ask the question I'm 14 asking and try to answer it. 15 MS. EVERETT: Uh-huh. 16 MR. RAY: The bank accounts that have 17 HOT money in it, tax dollars are in bank accounts 18 19 somewhere. MS. EVERETT: Yes. 20 MR. RAY: That's the bank statements 21 we're are asking for. Did we get them? 22 MS. EVERETT: I don't believe you did. 23 And the only reason is because we had our accounts stolen earlier this year. And not the tourism things 25

1 but the Chamber account. We will be happy for somebody to come look at those but actually (inaudible) we felt like we were liable for this.

2

4

5

6 l

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. RAY: Did -- your banks lost their ability to regenerate statements? Let's back up. many bank accounts are there with HOT money in it? Real live bank accounts with different account numbers sitting in a bank?

MS. EVERETT: Two different accounts, two different banks. Our bookkeeper is here.

MR. FORBUS: I think our attorney had wanted some input here.

MR. SCHNEIDER: Specifically, the contract states the bank -- I mean that the city has the right to review the documents. Obviously, if the city funds in the bank account held by the Chamber, the bank certainly can produce those documents. They can redact my account numbers to prevent anybody seeing them and preventing any theft. In fact, this is what we quite often when somebody asks for city records under the public information act, if it contains personal information such as somebody's personal bank account number we redact it. And the AG allows us to redact it. So the same process can be followed here.

> MS. EVERETT: (Inaudible) but nobody

```
said a word about it.
                  MR. RAY: Did you get this letter March
2
   27th, 2009?
3
                                Yes, sir, I did.
                  MS. EVERETT:
5
                  MR. RAY: And it says all associated
   bank statements.
6
7
                  MS. EVERETT: (Inaudible).
                  MR. RAY: Are you saying you didn't have
8
   time to get the bank statements?
                  MS. EVERETT: No, I did not. I said we
10
   got that and I apologize you didn't get them.
                                                   You can
11
   blame me, not you.
                  MR. RAY:
                            The next request is for all
13
   credit card statements that are paid for with HOT
14
   funds.
15
                  MS. EVERETT: And you got those.
16
                  MR. RAY:
                            All credit card statements
17
   that were paid for with HOT funds. Because in your
18
   ledger there is routine, I thought, rather large
19
   payments to pay off a credit card; twenty-eight
20
   hundred, twenty-four hundred, sixteen hundred, eighteen
21
   hundred, month after month, and I don't have any credit
22
   card statements to back that up. In fact, I don't have
23
24
   any credit card statements.
                  MS. EVERETT: We sent them over.
                                                     I had
25
```

a copy of the ones we sent. 1 MR. FORBUS: Right here. 2 MR. RAY: That's not a credit card 3 statement. I have a self-generated document. I do not 4 I have a statement from a credit card company. 5 No, that's not 6 MS. EVERETT: self-generated. That comes directly from the credit 7 card company, and there is a listing of those 81 statements and we tell you what every expenditure and 9 10 what that was for. MR. RAY: What's been redacted? 11 MS. EVERETT: Things that were not HOT 12 13 tax. MR. RAY: So you're using a credit card 14 15 to pay HOT fund items and other items? MS. EVERETT: Yeah. But it's -- the 16 credit card may be used in that case but the payment comes from one account or the other. 18 l MR. LINDEMAN: So a payment for the 19 month of March of 2007 would reflect only the expenses 20 in that report that are May of 2000 -- or March of Is that what you're saying? In other words, we 22 2007? 23 could see somewhere where there was a payment for the HOT fund portion of that credit card out of a HOT fund 24 bank account? 25

MS. EVERETT: Right.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

about?

MR. LINDEMAN: Right? That's what I'm understanding you. I'm just trying to understand what you're saying there.

And if that wasn't MS. EVERETT: Yes. enough information we are happy to provide more but nobody contacted us and said there was anything missing. And we're not trying to keep the bank statements from anybody. I was just advised that it wasn't necessary.

MS. HEILAND: Are there records of credit cards, in addition to the statements, in terms of the actual slips and all of that --

> Sure, absolutely. MS. EVERETT:

MR. RAY: So you will be willing to give us the invoice as well as the statements, themselves? MS. EVERETT: Absolutely.

18 MR. LINDEMAN: This may be a question

for Leonard, but what would be in a bank account dedicated to HOT funds that would be a security risk? I quess if they transferred money electronically to another account, maybe that would be a risk. But what would be in a bank account that contains HOT funds that would be a security risk that we would have a concern

MR. SCHNEIDER: The only thing I could 1 state is that the Attorney General and the legislature 2 has enacted laws under the Public Information Act that 3 whenever somebody requests that a bank account -- a 4 check number -- let's say somebody requests a check 5 from the city, payment of whatever funds. Normally the 6 city is allowed to redact the account information. 7 Your actual account information that would be used to 8 transfer funds to give to another banking institution 9 to put on line to pay a bill. And that's the 10 information that they deemed to allow us to redact. 11 So I'm not a banker, but I would assume 12 that that's the information they wish to keep 13 I don't confidential. And certainly it makes sense. 14 want anybody having my bank account number if I pay the 15 city a check and somebody requests a copy of it. 16 So it's electronic MR. LINDEMAN: 17 transfers is where you would run into that, right? 18 MR. SCHNEIDER: Yeah. For example, if I 19 paid the city water bill and then Lanny decides to 20 request my check that paid the city water bill, and I 21 don't want Lanny to have my checking account number 22 where he could use it some way electronically, the city 23 can redact it. 24

25

MR. RAY: But not the amount or the fact

that the payment --

20 l

23 l

MR. SCHNEIDER: Not the amount or who it was paid to, no.

MR. LINDEMAN: It seems like that there ought to be a -- first of all we ought to be sensitive to the security issue. In this day and age by all means we should be sensitive to the security issue. But it seems to me like -- I mean, this is responsible government agency here. You're a responsible -- or they are a responsible community agency working under a city contract and the bank has security procedures. It seems like we ought to be able to set up some kind of a fairly simple security process that protects that information.

MR. FORBUS: I have a suggestion. If you're going to provide -- if we want to provide the total picture to someone we could provide it from the Chamber to Winston for his eyes only and he could verify everything and redact any kind of security risk. If he would accept that responsibility, I guess. I have given it to him without asking him.

MS. EVERETT: Be happy to. It was my understanding there were going to be multiple copies distributed.

MR. FORBUS: Well, yeah, we don't want

1 that. MR. LINDEMAN: That would be a mistake 2 to do that. Even if there was no security issue. 3 MR. FORBUS: Pass the information on 4 after he has made it is secure. I think that would be 5 the way to go. He's nodding so --6 7 MR. RAY: You said a moment ago it was your understanding that we didn't really need the bank 8 statements. Where did you get that understanding from? MS. EVERETT: I'm sorry? 10 MR. RAY: A moment ago you said it was 11 your understanding we didn't really need the bank statements even though we had asked for them. Where 13 did you obtain that information from? 14 MS. EVERETT: I don't believe I said 15 that. If I did I'm sorry. 16 That's pretty much a quote. MR. RAY: 17 My understanding was you didn't need them. 18 asking where you got that from. 19 MS. EVERETT: I apologize. That's not 20 what I meant. 21 MR. RAY: And I just looked at these 22 credit card statements, these purported credit card 23 statements. They are only for about one year. 24 don't go back as far as we asked for. And I can't find

```
any payments listed on here. Again, quite frankly, I
1
   don't think this is a credit card statement.
3 this is self-generated.
                  MS. EVERETT: No.
                                     We gave you three
4
  years of credit card -- three years of credit card
5
   charges directly from American Express. They generated
6
   the documents.
7
8
                  MS. HEILAND: This is end of the year
9
   statement.
                  MR. RAY:
                            This is end of the year?
10
                            Typical end of the year
                  HEILAND:
11
   statement that any card holder gets. I have seen
   those --
13 l
                  MR. RAY: I don't think any of these
14
   statements are going to be adequate because I can't
15
   match these up. I have a twenty-eight hundred dollar
16
   payment to a credit card and it's not on here.
17
                  MR. FORBUS: Total amount of twenty
18
19
   thousand one hundred -- (inaudible).
                  MR. RAY: Let's continue. We had asked
20
   for payroll expenses for CVB gift shop and Chamber
21
   employees. And the rational behind that was at several
22
   meetings you have told us the way you decide how much
23
   is the management fees is you subjectively determine
24
   the percentage of your in-house activities are being
25
```

directly used for tourism and you allocate that amount. We have the amounts you allocate but we don't know what a hundred percent is. So we can't verify that the 3 twenty-three percent -- or actually it varies widely up 4 to forty percent you have claimed in the last six 5 months is accurate. And given the wide variations it 6 seems a bit dubious. That's the idea for asking for 7 the totals of your in-house Op expenses along with your 8 employees expenses so we can do the math for ourselves. 9 Because it looks like someone is having difficulty with 10 it over there. 11 We gave you the total 12 MS. EVERETT: Chamber compensation as well as everybody who is 13 compensated with hotel occupancy tax. 14 MR. RAY: You gave us what? 15 There is a copy --16 MS. EVERETT: MR. FORBUS: Dee, would you come and 17 speak up here? I think -- yeah. 18 MS. EVERETT: I have a copy of the same 19 report. And this is -- it says Huntsville Walker 20 County Chamber of Commerce administration and operation expenses, January through December, 2008, is the one I 22 have on top. There is also a 2007 and a 2006. 23 there we show you all of the Chamber's administration 24 salaries, health expenses, all of that. And then we 25

```
show you the CVB administrative transfer and how much
1
2
   that is.
                  MR. FORBUS: Is that in this document?
3
                  MS. HEILAND: Is that it?
4
                  MS. EVERETT: Yes, that is.
5
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Where is it, Connie?
6
   Where is it in there?
7
                  MS. HEILAND: It's in the very back of
8
   the skinny book. And I just found it today when I was
9
   going through this stuff after about four hours. So if
   that's it. Good, it's right before a blue sheet.
                  MS. EVERETT: From what I understand
12
   ya'll wanted to know the total salary dollars and
   compensation and other administrative expenses that the
14
   Chamber had and they are all lined out there.
15
                  MS. HEILAND:
                                Okay. I see that there is
16
   a CVB administrative transfer of bonuses. And that's
17
   for several years, the years that you have provided us.
181
   And then you have the salaries for a total of
19
   two-hundred and eight thousand. And you will stand by
20
   that for each of the years?
                                Stand by --
                  MS. EVERETT:
22
                                Those numbers?
23
                  MS. HEILAND:
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                Yes.
                                      These are our year
24
25
   end --
```

MS. HEILAND: I guess I was curious. 1 That's kind of what caught my interest and I realized 2 what it was. So there were bonuses given to all the 3 gift shop --4 MS. EVERETT: Are you talking about the 5 left-hand column? 6 The bonuses under --MS. HEILAND: Yes. 7 That left-hand column, MS. EVERETT: 8 that was the Chamber of Commerce. The left-hand column 9 that is all the Chamber of Commerce. The right-hand 10 column is all the CVB administrative transfer. 11 the money that goes into the Chamber for the contract. And that covers the salaries and the accounting and all 13 that the Chamber does for the CVB. 14 So that total of fifty-seven thousand 15 goes into -- that fee is paid to the Chamber for what 16 we do as far as personnel and all of those things. 17 MS. HEILAND: So -- I'm sorry if I'm 18 being -- there is a lot of material here to cover. So 19 the -- your total salaries for the Chamber, every 20 Chamber salary, is two-hundred eight thousand for 21 January through December? 22 MS. EVERETT: Yes. 23 And then this is the MS. HEILAND: 24 column, fifty-seven thousand zero one three twenty? 25

Uh-huh. And that fifty MS. EVERETT: seven thousand, if you recall when the comptroller was here, he said that if a person -- half of their time is spent on tourism then half of their salary plus half of their benefits should come from the hotel occupancy tax. We have a flat fee here and it does not cover all of those things in particular. We've always been asked to target it directly to the payroll, the salary expense of people who were doing that. And, you know, I will be honest, I would be more comfortable if we could say this person does twenty percent and this person -- but it is, you know, we are not a place that you can easily departmentalize or compartmentalize because, you know, whatever happens in a given day, if we have three or four people in the lobby, whoever is available is going to service them. MS. HEILAND: Can I go add? I remember this point. Excuse me, I remember this point from the

this point. Excuse me, I remember this point from the speech the last time. There is very simple ways to do that. You just keep track of your time during the day. I mean, there are some of us that do that every day. And you just keep track if you spend an hour servicing something you keep track of that. And what you're telling me is at this point you don't do that?

MS. EVERETT: No, we don't do that. I

1

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

mean, we have in periods just to kind of gauge where we were. But we haven't been doing that. But Kim's time is totally dedicated to CVB and then everybody else steps in to help as needed. And we don't cost out that -- those other salaries.

MS. HEILAND: So then how do you arrive at the percentage?

MS. EVERETT: How do we arrive at the percentage of our total salaries?

MS. HEILAND: Uh-huh.

MS. EVERETT: Well, we have just -- over the years we've had just an administrative fee that helps pay for the person who is the chief administrator of it. And, you know, we've been asked to direct it to certain salaries. And every year I have sent the same memo that says it is very difficult to say it's just this person and it's just this person. You know, believe it or not you have six people at the Chamber of Commerce who are helping do convention and visitors bureau. And if we started to say, you know, okay, this fifteen minutes on tourism and this, you know, it would cost a lot more, I promise you. But we have been asked to segment it to whoever is spending the time.

Shannon, our bookkeeper, she does a lot of her time generating financials, paying bills, you

know, all of the things that have to do with the --1 administering of the dollars that are there. 2 takes an awful lot of her time. Because we also have the visitors center and the gift shop to deal with. MS. HEILAND: I recall, I think it was 5 in November, could be December, you said fifty percent 6 of Shannon's time is spent on tourism related. 7 MR. FORBUS: Yes. It's on this page. 8 MS. HEILAND: Okay. That's how you've 9 allocated it? 10 MS. EVERETT: Yeah. 11 MR. RAY: And the fifty-seven thousand 12 we mentioned earlier, that does not include the visitor 13 center's money that's also paid to Ms. Thomas? 14 No, it doesn't. MS. EVERETT: 15 MR. RAY: Which would bring the number 16 to eighty-seven thousand, or roughly forty-two percent 17 of your in-house budget. Using your numbers. 18 MS. EVERETT: Well, that is paying her 19 her salary. This person manages the convention and 20 visitors bureau. She also manages the visitors center 21 and the gift shop. So there is three components to her 22 job. There are three parts to her salary. 23 That's correct. MR. RAY: 24 MS. EVERETT: Pardon? 25

```
MR. RAY: That's correct.
                                              But her
 1
   salary is entirely paid out of HOT money one way or the
 2
   other?
 3
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 It is except gift shop
 4
   funds are not necessarily HOT money. We don't have any
 5
   HOT money budgeted in the gift shop.
 61
 7
                  MR. RAY:
                             The question was Ms. Thomas'
 8
   salary is a hundred percent paid with HOT money from
   one source or another, yes?
 9
10
                  MS. EVERETT: I guess you can say that
   because it all goes in the same fund.
11
                            And when you add that number
                  MR. RAY:
12
   and it's $87,000 of your personnel expenses for the
13
   folks that work down the street here comes out of HOT
   money. You said $57,000, you add in the other thirty
15
   that gets you $87,000.
16
17
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                Yes.
                                       But we don't just
  manage one place, though.
18
19
                  MR. RAY:
                            That's not my question.
20
                  MS. EVERETT: Are you paying us $87,000
21
   to do the job? Is that what you're asking?
                  MR. RAY:
                            No. The question was quite
22
   specific. $87,000 of your in-house personnel expenses
23
   comes from HOT money, correct?
25
                  MS. EVERETT: Of the people housed at
```

the Chamber? 1 MR. RAY: Yes, ma'am. 2 MS. EVERETT: I quess that's correct, 3 4 yes. 5 MR. RAY: And if you add that back in it's not twenty-eight percent, that comes up to 6 forty-two percent. Which is why -- you keep saying you do this by deciding how much, subjectively how much of 8 your in-house OPs are dedicated to tourism but then you 9 give us a number that's twenty-eight percent and it's 101 really more like forty-two percent. We get to ask 11 these questions but we have to. 12 MS. EVERETT: Absolutely. But we have 13 three different budgets we work with. So it's really 14 15 the semantics of it. And we would be happy --MR. RAY: No, ma'am, it's not. It's all 16 HOT money, it's all tax money. 17 MS. EVERETT: Not all of the money that 18 19 we operate on --MR. RAY: The money we are talking about 20 21 here is just HOT money. It's the city's money but 22 MS. EVERETT: it's not technically HOT money. We don't spend HOT 23 money in that budget. Now, if the city purchased the 24 original inventory out of the HOT money I don't know 25

```
where that -- if that came out of the HOT money or came
1
   out of the general revenue. But there has never been
2
   anymore HOT money that has gone in the gift shop. I
 3
   mean, we generate a substantial amount of money to make
 4
   all of that work. We don't just take the salaries and
 5
   go. We generate additional income into that.
   you say it's all HOT money, yes, the majority of her
   salary is HOT money.
8
                  MR. RAY:
                           And you're in-house
 9
   receptionist, one-hundred percent?
10
                  MS. EVERETT: We've been asked to
11
   dedicate it to a body. And if we have to dedicate it
   to a body it would be the receptionist. But that
   doesn't mean that somebody else doesn't step in to do
   that job as well.
15
                            Who asked you to do that?
                  MR. RAY:
16
                                I would satisfy every city
17
                  MS. EVERETT:
  manager I ever worked with.
18
                  MR. RAY: The city manager has asked you
19
20
   to do that?
                  MS. EVERETT: Yes.
                                      To dedicate it to
21
   bodies. And Winston has, too.
22
23
                  MR. RAY:
                            Winston said pick one person,
   pin the tail on them and that's where it goes?
                  MS. EVERETT: He said tell us who you
25
```

would assign this money to.

MR. RAY: We

MR. RAY: Well, that's not the same as telling you to pick somebody and use a hundred percent. Let me just cut to this. You're not telling us your receptionist spends a hundred percent of her time doing hotel stuff? Hotel tax stuff, are you?

MS. EVERETT: No. And I clarify that every time I send it in.

MR. RAY: But when we allocate HOT money hundred percent of her salary comes from it?

MS. EVERETT: Yes. Because that is so much simpler than if we say ten percent of this person's salary, twenty percent of this one's, thirty percent of that. And that is the only reason because it's simpler.

MR. RAY: So you think we just look in the aggregate all over, how many of the hundred percent is hotel tax?

MS. EVERETT: Look at the aggregate of our salaries?

MR. RAY: At the aggregate operations over there and how much is hotel tax valid and how much you do other stuff? You want us to look at the big picture instead of looking at individual? Is that what you're saying? Because if we look at the individual

```
it's wrong, right?
 1
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 Yes. It makes more sense.
 2
                  MR. RAY: So you want to look at the big
 3
   picture, yes?
                  MS. EVERETT: Yes.
                                       You're hiring six
 5
   people to help do the job that you hired us to do.
 6
 7
                  MR. RAY: And that number right now is
 8
   about forty-two percent?
 9
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 Forty-two percent of --
                            Personnel costs?
                  MR. RAY:
10
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                No, sir. Because the
11
   other thirty that you're talking about with her is not
12
   in this number.
13
                            Where does it come from?
                  MR. RAY:
14
                                 It comes from the visitors
                  MS. EVERETT:
15
16
   center.
17
                  MR. RAY:
                            Which is also hotel tax
   hundred percent, yes?
18
19
                  MS. EVERETT: Uh-huh.
                                         But it is not --
   I mean, we have people who work out at just the
20 I
  visitors center or the gift shop. And I really think
21
   it is just in the reporting that it's confusing.
22
   we had a contract for tourism services, the addendum
   was added, and now we have three different statements
   because we are doing three different things.
25
```

```
MR. RAY: How many bank accounts are out
 1
 2
   there at the visitors center and gift shop?
                  MS. EVERETT: One.
                                      Right?
 3
                  VOICE: (Inaudible).
 4
                  MS. EVERETT: We have to have a separate
 5
   one for credit card transactions so --
 6
 7
                  MR. RAY: But everything else is in the
   same bank account?
 8
                  MS. EVERETT: Yeah.
 9
                  MR. RAY: And the shop is not a HOT
10
  activity?
11
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                No. But it's the city's
12
13 money.
                  MR. RAY:
                            I understand that. And the
14
15 visitors center is a HOT activity?
                  MS. EVERETT: Yes.
                                      And we do have
16
   separation on the financial statements so you can see
17
   directly where that money came from.
18
19
                  MR. RAY: But the HOT money and the non
   HOT money are in the same bank account then?
21
                  MS. EVERETT: Yes. And they are all the
   city's money.
22
                  MR. RAY: And the gift shop shows a zero
23
   balance year after year?
24
                  MS. EVERETT: No, it does not show a
25
```

```
zero balance. Some years it will have a couple of
1
   thousand dollars profit. There have been two or three
   years where it had a little bit of a loss.
                  MR. RAY: And when there is a loss is
4
   that subsidized by HOT money?
5
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                No.
6
                  MR. RAY: Or does it just run in the red
7
   for a while?
8
                                It cash flows itself.
                                                        Ιt
                  MS. EVERETT:
9
   has ups and downs but it cash flows itself.
10
   never asked you for another penny for that.
                                                 The money
11
   that stays -- there is a little bit of money that stays
   in the account from year to year so that we don't have
   to ever come ask for money if there is a cash flow
   problem.
15
                  MR. RAY: And when it makes a profit
16
   what happens to those funds?
17
                  MS. EVERETT: The money stays there and
18
   is still the city's money. We audit that every single
19
20
   year.
                  MR. RAY: Are there any transfers out of
21
   the -- well, how could you tell if they are the same
22
23
   bank account?
                                Because we generate two
24
                  MS. EVERETT:
   different financial statements and that's what our CPA
25
```

has said is sufficient. We have two different financial analyses; one in the visitors center and one in the gift shop, so that we can see the separation and we know what was generated out of which.

Now, in the visitors center you not only have the hotel tax but you have the papers that we generate and the money goes straight to the city.

We're selling bricks out there still and the money goes straight to the city. We have donations that we take in for tours that we do. We have donations that just come there to that site and all of the money is the city's.

MR. RAY: We also asked for transcripts and samples of media advertisements purchased with HOT funds except excluding the brochures that we've all got. Did we get a good sampling of those?

MS. EVERETT: Sampling, yes.

MR. RAY: And we also asked for any other document that could substantiate or support the contention that the HOT funds are being spent to directly promote the tourism and hotel industry. You didn't hold anything back did you? Except the bank statements we've already discussed and the credit card statements?

MS. EVERETT: I mean, we could show you,

you know, twenty-five years worth of stuff --

MR. RAY: We were specifically asking for three years in here.

MS. EVERETT: Right. Well, I mean, when you say a statement like that we don't know exactly what you're looking for. If you want something specific --

MR. RAY: Well, you were here when the comptroller said that one of the key parts is to come back after the fact and justify. And that's not just events, that's anything you're doing with it.

MS. EVERETT: Yes, sir.

MR. RAY: Well, that's what this is asking for. So we can come back and substantiate. As Ms. Heiland mentioned, if you had a phone log for your receptionists then you would know how much time she spends doing HOT activities and other activities as opposed to just the slag we are dealing with now.

MS. EVERETT: This report is in addition to the monthly reports and the annual report that we had given you. We made a budget presentation where we show you all of the things that we do in a year. And this is in addition to all of that. We have these books with all of our printing and the things that we promote Huntsville with.

And I understand completely the heads and the beds. And, you know, I think Mr. Baine will back me up, that it is very difficult to figure out exactly how, you know, every single thing you do nets a head in a bed. It is likely to cause somebody to stay in your community. And a lot of the people that we promote to come because they have a really good impression of Huntsville and we've worked hard to make that happen.

MR. FORBUS: I would like to interject something.

MR. RAY: You want to go into some detail on that?

MR. FORBUS: What I would like to ask, I know Kimm had said something about you had plans for a means of substantiating heads in beds. You were heading in that direction. What exactly are your plans to provide that? Get that information? Because I know it's going to be very important for you guys to operate a program, a project, that if you don't know if it's bringing anybody to town. And so, you know, we got one suggestion by the comptroller's representative and that was that you go out to the hotels and get questionnaires for the people who stay there. And that is a probably the best way. Now, do ya'll have any

other suggestions?

18 l

19 l

MS. THOMAS: I have gone back and formulated a survey already and I did not include it in here and that's because I'm still tweaking it. But I have gone back and formulated a survey to present to the hoteliers that will give us that type of information. Not only that, I have also gone through and established a booking survey that we can send out to different organizations and things of that nature about what type of meetings they have and gathering information so that we'll know who we can call on in order to get them here as well.

MR. FORBUS: See, I think that's going to be a very big key in any kind of a program that is funded by the HOT money is that we got to come up with some way of substantiating if we are putting heads in beds. Because as the comptroller said, an individual or a hotelier can come and make a lot of difficulty if they don't feel like we are spending the money correctly. So we want to make sure that we have as much substantiation at we can get.

MS. EVERETT: And we have not only that survey looking at the hotels but some other documentation that would be events that we, you know, are involved in or other things that happen that we

```
want to be able to demonstrate to you how many heads
   were in beds because of that event. Or because of
 3
   that, you know, invitation or conference or what have
   you. And, you know, the measurement is something that
 4
   is different from counsel to counsel.
                  MR. FORBUS: Well, we're kind of picky.
 6
                  MS. EVERETT: It's your money. You can
 7
   be picky.
 8
 9
                  MR. FORBUS:
                                Absolutely.
                  MR. RAY:
10
                            What measurements are
11!
   different?
12
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                What measurements are
13
  different?
14
                  MR. RAY: You just said the measurements
  are different from counsel to counsel.
15
                  MS. EVERETT: Well, I to be honest with
16
   you. Ya'll heard from one source on the hotel-motel
17
   tax. And he talked about the expenditures of the hotel
18
   tax. Now, we've been to several different, you know,
19
20
   seminars on the hotel tax and everybody has a little
   bit different interpretation. Every lawyer has a
   different interpretation of the same document, right?
23
                  MR. RAY: No.
24
                  MS. EVERETT: I don't agree with that.
25
   Why would lawyers --
```

MR. RAY: Everything that guy said is already in the contract and in the statute. He didn't say anything that we didn't already know.

MS. EVERETT: Yes. But he did say that it's up to you to determine if one head in a bed means it worked or if a thousand heads in a bed means it worked.

MR. RAY: Right.

MS. EVERETT: So it's very hard to be able to meet your expectations when your expectations have not been spelled out for us. We have an old contract that we've been trying to get updated for several years with the city. We've had several different city managers to deal with. So please forgive us if we don't know exactly what to do at this point. We've be told to answer to the city manager and ya'll are trying to learn the ins and outs of the hotel tax, something that we have made sure we knew.

MR. RAY: We're not here talking about certain events and whether or not they are putting heads in beds. I don't think anybody here is even questioning any of the events. I haven't heard them, not since I been on this board and I don't think I missed a meeting. The contract hasn't changed and all we are doing is what I started off saying,

```
accountability and compliance. The contract still says
 1
  exactly what it says and we haven't deviated from it at
 2
  all and don't intend to. The standards are the same.
 3
                  MS. EVERETT: But your measurement is a
 4
 5
  little different. Do you not agree with that?
                  MR. RAY: Perhaps our scrutiny is a
 6
 7
   little heightened because of the perceived problem
   which has been validated. We have a problem here on
 9
   accountability. We don't know what's going on with
10
   this money.
                  MS. EVERETT: Validated by whom?
11
12
                  MR. RAY:
                            These are self-generated
   documents. We have to believe you to believe you.
13
                  MS. EVERETT: We have a CPA that audits
14
15
   us every year.
                  MR. RAY: He audits the books you give
16
   him just like he does mine.
17
18
                  MS. EVERETT: He comes into our office
19
   and works on it.
                  MR. RAY: He, himself, says it's not a
20
   compliance audit. He takes the numbers you give him
21
   and does a general accounting principles audit and
22
   gives you the final numbers and can run your 1065's, or
23
   whatever it is he does like he does with everybody
24
   else. Doesn't have anything to do with compliance.
25
```

```
And that's what we are here trying to determine, which
1
   is why we are asking these questions and I am running
2
   out of patience. You know, maybe you think it's okay
3
   to answer questions different ways every meeting and
  waste my time.
5 l
                  MS. EVERETT: Mr. Ray, that is not what
6
   I do. Sometimes we have -- we have overlapping budget
7
   years. And if the numbers change it's because the year
8
9
   changed.
                  MR. FORBUS: Well, I think we've -- it's
10
  time to move on to --
11
                  MR. RAY: Well, no, I think there are
12
   plenty of questions on the details.
                  MR. FORBUS: I mean into the details,
14
15 move on to the details of the --
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Before we do that could I
16
   try one thing?
17
                  MR. FORBUS: Go ahead, sure.
18
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I got lost about fifteen
19
20
   minutes ago here to tell you the truth. I'm just a
   plain old country boy. I don't understand all of this
21
   high finance. Could I do something very simple, Dee?
22
23
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                Uh-huh.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Let me go back to the
24
25
   letter that was sent --
```

MS. EVERETT: Sure. 1 MR. LINDEMAN: And that you responded 2 to. And let me go down the list and you just tell me 3 your take on this. On the first item that was asked for was 5 the ledgers. Well, let's just take the ledgers. 6 MS. EVERETT: And those were all given. 7 I agree. I think we 8 MR. LINDEMAN: 9 should note for the record that the response on the ledgers was, as far as I can tell, one-hundred percent. 10 MS. EVERETT: Thank you. 11 MR. LINDEMAN: Account statements, I 12 think --13 MS. EVERETT: The bank statements, no. 14 That's what we are lacking. 15 l MR. LINDEMAN: Books -- well, there is a 16 little bit of additional information. I don't know if 17 that constitutes books. Do you have other books 18 besides this that would shed light on this problem? Or 19 this subject? Are there other -- I guess it's a 20 variation of the question he asked. Is there other 21 information that you did not give us other than bank 22 accounts and credit card statements, which we 23 understand why you didn't give those to us. Is there 24

anything besides that that would shed light on this?

```
MS. EVERETT: I don't believe so.
 1
   if there is something else you want to look at --
 2
 3
                  MR. LINDEMAN: So the answer -- well, I
 4
   don't want to look at it if it doesn't exist.
 5
                  MS. EVERETT: I don't think there would
 6
   be anything other than that.
 7
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                Okay. So the answer is
   that there are no books that would -- other than the
 8
   bank accounts and --
 9
                  MS. EVERETT: Yeah. And we keep
10
   complete yearly ledger books. You know, we keep all
11
  the financial documents.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. Now, then, the
13
   second thing was the bank statements. We've talked
14
15
   about that.
16
                  MR. RAY: We're going to get them in the
   morning?
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah.
                                        We understood
18
   that. Credit card statements. Let me ask you
19
   something on the credit cards. I saw in here two
20
   credit -- a series of credit card charges, one for Kimm
   Thomas and one for Rhonda, I believe.
23
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                Yes. Rhonda was in that
24
   position the first year that ya'll asked for it.
25
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Are those the only two
```

people that have used a credit card and put HOT money on it in the last three years?

MS. EVERETT: Yes, it should be.

MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. So no one else at the Chamber uses a credit cart and that is paid for out of HOT money?

MS. EVERETT: No. I use a credit card in there -- I don't think there would be anything in there that would be HOT. We probably used mine at a time or two that we had to charge merchandise for the gift shop. But, you know, if that's the case we've been -- I mean, I don't know that we have any of that in the last three years.

MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. And the reason those two are the CVB, they were in the CVB, that's why they have the credit card privilege and no one else does, I gather?

MS. EVERETT: Yes.

MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. Payroll expenses for all CVB, gift shop and Chamber employees. There are a lot of payroll expenses reflected in the ledger and I think that's helpful. But one thing that I couldn't tell, at least in my review so far, is whether -- I assume that all of these payroll expenses that are reflected in here are paid for out of HOT

```
1
   money?
 2
                  MS. EVERETT: Yes.
 3
                   MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah.
                   MS. EVERETT: Yes. And then this that
 4
   has all of the chamber expenses so you will see what
   our total is.
 7
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                 And that was very helpful
   to me, also. Those three pages that you refer to are
 8
   total Chamber expenses?
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 On the left-hand side.
10
11
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                 Right.
12
                  MS. EVERETT: And then the right-hand
   side is what we get from occupancy tax.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I'm sorry, would you say
14
15
   that again?
16
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 The right-hand side where
   you see CVB administrative transfer?
18
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                 Okav.
19
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 It's got just three lines
   there that total what the administrative transfer is.
21
   And then the same down here. You have about six lines
   that show everything that would be in operations.
23
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                 Okay. So the left column
24
   is total and the right column is HOT?
25
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                Is HOT, yes, sir.
```

MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. 1 2 MS. HEILAND: With one exception that thirty-seven -- I think I heard there is some money 3 4 that is going to be in addition on the CVB side --5 MS. EVERETT: Well, but that never goes to the Chamber. That goes to her because she manages 6 7 the gift shop. It does not go to the chamber. 8 Not go to the Chamber. HEILAND: MS. EVERETT: 9 No. MS. HEILAND: It's right out of the 10 11 till? Is that what you're telling me? 12 MR. RAY: No. It's directly from the visitors center. You can see it in the ledger. 13 cut a check straight -- you get two checks? 14 15 MS. THOMAS: I get one check. No. 16 MR. RAY: One check? Okay, then that's not what's happening. 18 MS. HIGBIE: The Chamber transfers money to the visitors center to cover the Chamber portion and 19 CVB portion and Kim's salary and the visitors center 20 money comes from their account. 21 22 MR. RAY: So you get one check from the 23 visitors center and the HOT CVB account transfers the 241 other part up there?

VOICE:

Yes.

MR. RAY: Okay. 1 MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. The -- I'm trying 2 to decide on that number four, if that's -- if we got 3 what we asked for or not. Payroll expenses -- number 5 four was payroll expenses for all CVB, gift shop and Chamber of Commerce employees. 7 MR. RAY: In the aggregate. 8 MS. EVERETT: Not really? 9 MR. RAY: No, I said in the aggregate. We got a total. We didn't get a by name. 10 MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah. 11 If we wanted to know -- I'm not saying we would ask this, but I'm 12 saying if we wanted to know in September of 2007 what 13 each of the employees got out of HOT money versus 14 15 Chamber money, could we tell that from this report or is that something else you would have to give us? 16 17 I guess it would be MS. EVERETT: 18 something else we would have to give you. But we --MR. LINDEMAN: But the HOT portion would 19 20 be here, right? MS. EVERETT: 21 Yeah. 22 MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah. The thing that we wouldn't have would be the Chamber contribution to this 23 person's salary? 24 25 MR. FORBUS: The total amount, yes.

MR. LINDEMAN: I gather. 1 2 MS. EVERETT: Yes, I guess so. But, you 3 know, it really -- you know, we've been asked to target it to particular bodies so we put it in those. 5 that make sense? 6 MR. LINDEMAN: Well, I understand what you're saying. I don't know if I want to talk about that or not. I don't know how you artificially target money when people aren't doing what the law says. mean, I just don't understand. I'm a country boy, I 10 11 just don't understand that. MS. EVERETT: Well, the job is being 12 done. And the money, we place it on that person. 13 that person may be assisted by several other people. 14 15 MR. LINDEMAN: And that person may be doing other things besides --16 17 MS. EVERETT: Right, yes. 18 MR. LINDEMAN: And that's okay to do 19 Somebody has said that's okay to do that? That's not my understanding of this law. Help me, 20 attorney. 21 22 MS. HEILAND: I think -- well, I'm going to go on a totally different direction. 23 I think we are

sort of getting off track here. I think it is

something that there can be some recommendations on as

24

```
to how to handle this better because, obviously, you
   know, it's not meeting a lot of the requirements of the
   law in terms of being able to substantiate as it
 3
   relates to the work being done. So it maybe a little
   tweaking but maybe that just needs to be a clearer up
   front rather than just left.
 7
                   MR. LINDEMAN: Well, I thought that's
   what we were trying to understand.
 8
 9
                   MS. EVERETT: We'll be happy to
   re-evaluate.
10
                            We'll see what Mr. Schneider
11
                  MR. RAY:
   has on that.
12
13
                  MR. SCHNEIDER:
                                   Was there a question
   that you want me to answer, sir?
14
15
                   MR. RAY:
                             I think the question, if I can
   restate it was right now we are showing an individual
16
   as being financed one-hundred percent out of hotel
17
   money when we know they don't do one hundred percent of
18
   the job with the thought being that other people don't
19
   have any allocated to them but they are doing some.
20
                                                         Ιs
21
   that okay to target it that way even though we know
   it's spread out?
22
23
                  MR. SCHNEIDER:
                                   I think -- I'm going to
   fudge a little bit, I'll be honest with you. Number
24
   one, the percentage that is paid from the HOT tax for
25
```

work done should be accurately kept and should be substantiated by documents.

1

2

3

4

5

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I'll give you an example. If one person is funded one-hundred percent by HOT funds, realistically we all do not know that that person is not going to spend one-hundred percent time. But they should make an effort to spend all of their time on there. And if they are spending fifteen percent of their time or twenty percent of their time, or whatever percentage the law says is a little if-e on something else, that should be stopped. If what I said makes sense. So if they are spending -- if they are working forty hours and case law states that thirty-eight hours is okay, we all understand that two hours may be handled in a personal call or helping somebody else, and that's what you need to document. But they're spending a larger percentage of hours then you need to document that. And you need to probably state how much is being funded from the HOT tax versus how much is being funded from the Chamber funds.

MR. LINDEMAN: But we still have a case here where, as Lanny said, we have people being paid for a hundred percent out of HOT funds and they are not doing a hundred percent HOT work. I just don't understand how that's proper.

MR. SCHNEIDER: Again, the reporting requirements probably that you're requesting would be that there be some type of ledger kept. Just like when I bill my clients -- and Lanny made this point -- I put down the time I spend on each function. And I know it's a little bit of added burden, but that would be one way to do it.

MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah. But you would be paid appropriately according to what you did.

MR. SCHNEIDER: That's correct.

MR. LINDEMAN: By that scenario. And that's not what's happening here.

MS. EVERETT: See, it's a little bit different because, you know, I mean, then would you recalculate all of the compensation? I mean, we're technically we're being paid \$57,000 to administer all of the tourism programs. So would you want us to just keep records of every hour that that person or every half hour --

MR. LINDEMAN: In my mind the answer to that's pretty simple. The consultant we had here last week -- or last month was specifically asked that question. And he said you should pay the person in proportion to whatever amount of work that person does in HOT money. And he didn't put any fuzz on that

```
peach. That's the way I understood that.
 2
                   MS. EVERETT:
                                 Yeah.
                                        But he also said
   that you pay a hundred percent of their benefits from
 3
   that as well and we are not doing that.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I didn't hear that.
 5
                   MS. EVERETT: He said whatever
 6
 7
   percentage of the benefits --
 8
                  MR. RAY: Yeah. He didn't say a hundred
   percent, he said whatever portion.
10
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 Whatever percentage,
   right. And so, you know, all we are designating it is
11
   as salary.
12
                  MR. FORBUS: You know, the bottom line
13
   is that it might be a wash but we don't know.
14
                  MS. EVERETT: Yeah.
15
16
                  MR. FORBUS: So the only way to find out
   is to document the information.
17
18
                  MS. EVERETT: Be happy to.
19
                  MR. FORBUS: And then see what we can
   do. I think that's what we are going -- am I speaking
20
21
   correctly?
                  MS. SCHNEIDER: Yes.
                                        You would like to
22
23
   have some type of record to show compliance.
   amount of records that you want shouldn't be too
   onerous. But they should be able to satisfy an audit
25
```

by a certified auditor.

2

3

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. LINDEMAN: And should we not clear the air that going forward at least we ought to quit doing that? That we ought to pay the people in proportion to the amount of work that they are actually doing out of HOT funds? I guess we're asking --

MR. BAINE: We have a budget. So up to the limits of that budget.

MR. LINDEMAN: The question I'm asking is they have the impression -- the Chamber has the impression from us, apparently, that they are supposed to cook the books is what I'm going to say because that is sure what it sounds like. It may be cooking the books for convenience, but it's altering the books, let's put it that way. The Chamber thinks they have direction from the City of Huntsville to account for these funds in a different way than we were told last month by the State Comptroller's Office that you're supposed to account for these funds. Should we not clear the air that that is not the right thing to do? That we gave them bad advice before and as of going forward we recommend that they go back to the method that's consistent with what we were told by the Comptroller's office?

MR. SCHNEIDER: That would appear to be

```
a safe approved course.
 1
                   MR. LINDEMAN: Mr. Chairman, I recommend
 2
   we do that. I make a motion that we establish that
 3
   that is the way we are going to proceed going forward.
 5
                   MR. FORBUS: Do I have a second?
 6
                   MR. RAY: Second.
 7
                   MR. FORBUS: I would like to hear all in
 8
   favor.
 9
                   MR. BARRETT:
                                 Well --
                          (Discussion)
10
                   MR. BARRETT: We are voting, I quess,
11
   then on a recommendation?
13
                   MR. LINDEMAN: That's right.
   recommendation.
14
15
                  MR. BARRETT: We are voting to recommend
   to counsel that this be -- we ask the Chamber to
161
   institute this additional documentation.
                  MR. BAINE: Would that -- this
18
19
   documentation is going to be in a new contract or just
   going to be a directive?
20
                  MS. HEILAND: Evidently the Chamber
21
   thinks they would like to have some contract language
   changed. They think it's possibly time to revisit
23
24
   it --
25
                  MR. RAY: The directive is entirely
```

consistent with the current contract. MS. HEILAND: 2 Is it? MR. RAY: Yes. Because the current 3 contract mirrors the law. 4 5 MS. HEILAND: Then I withdraw my 6 suggestion. 7 MR. BAINE: We'll just make that directive to Winston that that is the way it is 8 accounted. But I want to remind you that it's up to the limit of the budget. We have a contract with them 10 l that says so many dollars. It doesn't say so many 11 people. 12 Correct (inaudible). MR. RAY: This 13 isn't really a budgetary issue. 14 MR. LINDEMAN: I know. This is 15 accounting within the budget. And it's more than just 16 bookkeeping. It's actually the way the folks charge 17 18 the money. Or the way the Chamber pays them. MR. SCHNEIDER: I would just make one 19 The directive is fine. However, I think comment. 20 Winston can certainly contact the compliance auditor 21 and find out what they suggest for other cities that do 22 it so we don't reinvent the wheel --23 MR. FORBUS: I think we'll be addressing 24 something on a compliance audit through Winston pretty 25

soon so we can bring that to his attention then. 2 Mr. Chairman, I have just MR. LINDEMAN: 3 one more question and then I would yield back. MR. FORBUS: Go ahead. 4 5 MR. LINDEMAN: You said, Dee, this gift 6 shop thing, I'm really confused. I would like -- at some point I would like to have a top down total briefing on how the gift shop is handled. 9 MS. EVERETT: We would love to give you one. We would love to. 10 11 MR. LINDEMAN: Let me ask just one question now. You said that there is no HOT money in 12 the gift shop, I believe? 13 MS. EVERETT: No HOT money in our budget 14 15 at the gift shop. 16 MR. LINDEMAN: Then would you help me understand all of these transfers in here to the gift 17 shop from the visitors center that I see in this 18 Well, first of all, is the visitors center 19 ledger? strictly a HOT money account or is it --20 21 MS. EVERETT: Visitors center is. 22 MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. Well then what 23 would these transfers be? They appear to be -- they appear to be transfers of HOT money to the gift shop. 24

And there are pages after pages of them in here going

back through all three of these years. So I'm just curious what these are. 2 MS. EVERETT: I would have to look at 3 what you're talking about because I'm not really sure 5 of what those would be. Now, there are instances where, you know, if there were an item that Kimm were purchasing for a conference that she was purchasing from the gift shop maybe that would be. 9 MR. LINDEMAN: Here is a whole page of In fact, there are two pages of them. 10 them. This is in September of 2007 --11 MR. FORBUS: I need to interrupt for a 12 minute. I think there is a motion on the floor about 13 l letting Winston -- are we going to withdraw that motion 14 at this time? 15 16 MR. LINDEMAN: I'm sorry. MR. FORBUS: On the personnel --17 MR. RAY: Accountability of the 18 19 personnel. MR. FORBUS: Accounting of personnel 20 21 time. MR. LINDEMAN: Well, I don't know as 22 long as it is clear to everyone that the sense of this 23 group, at least, is that from now on people should be 24 25 paid in accordance with the work that they do.

```
MR. FORBUS: Okay.
 1
                                  If we don't need a motion
 2
                   MR. LINDEMAN:
 3
   on that --
 4
                   MR. FORBUS: Any motion at all, you want
 5
   to withdraw it?
 6
                   MR. LINDEMAN: I will withdraw it if
   it's the consensus that we don't need the motion.
                  MR. FORBUS: I think the attorney said
8
   we don't need the motion at this time. It's suggested
   that Winston get with the compliance auditor.
10
                  MR. SCHNEIDER:
                                   I think that the --
11
                  MR. BAINE: I think the tasking would go
12
   to the --
13
                                   The tasking would either
                  MR. SCHNEIDER:
14
   go to the city manager or to the counsel upon
15
   recommendation by this board.
16
17
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                  Okay. Back to this.
   don't have to do it now but I'm having trouble in my
18
19
   mind relating this to what you said.
                  MR. FORBUS: Why don't you show her a
20
   copy of that.
21
22
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. I refer you to
   page twenty-seven and twenty-eight, for example, of
23
   this sample pages of -- you can see what I'm talking
24
25
   about. You're reading it upside down.
```

```
MS. EVERETT:
                                 Yeah. It would be hard
 1
 2
   for me to know it offhand.
 3
                   MR. LINDEMAN:
                                  These are all through
          I mean, there are page after pages of them.
   here.
 5
                   MS. EVERETT:
                                 Well, that's why Shannon
              She's our bookkeeper.
 6
   is here.
                                     I'm not the
   bookkeeper, but I'm sure she can answer.
 8
                   MR. RAY:
                             We don't have an answer what
   we are buying at the gift shop.
10
                   MR. FORBUS:
                               Shannon is right here.
   Would you mind taking a look at this, Shannon, and give
11
12
   us --
                   MR. LINDEMAN:
                                  Here, look at this page.
13
14
   And just for the audience, what this page says, this is
   the general ledger from the visitors center and it's a
15
   list of puts and takes in the visitors center account.
16
   That is disbursements from and deposits to that
17
   account.
18
19
                   MS. HIGBIE:
                                The heading on this account
   is accounts receivable from American Express. These
20
21
   are all charges where people purchased items in the
   gift shop. And the money is coming in from American
22
23
   Express to cover those charges.
24
                   MR. LINDEMAN: It's coming into the
   visitors center?
25
```

```
1
                   MS. HIGBIE: This covers everything.
 2
   This visitors center and gift shop, this ledger does.
 3
                   MR. BARRETT: So they charge it to
   American Express and American Express --
 4
 5
                   MS. HIGBIE: Issues a check directly
 6
   to --
 7
                   MR. BARRETT: -- a check to this account
 8
   and then that is -- that's the refund to the gift shop
   because that's where the purchase originated?
10
                   MS. HIGBIE: Yes, exactly.
   covering the cost of merchandise.
11
                   MS. EVERETT: So the transfer is new
12
13
   money from somebody buying something. It's not HOT
14
   money.
                   MR. RAY:
15
                             Those charges are deposited to
   the CVB account?
16
                  MS. HIGBIE:
                                No.
                                     This is the visitors
17
   center account, not the convention and visitors bureau.
18
                             The question arises because
19
                  MR. RAY:
20
   throughout here there are several transfers from the
   CVB general ledger over to the -- find one real fast.
21
22
   Statue gift shop, $119, $65.
23
                  MS. HIGBIE: That would be where Kimm
   purchased items from the gift shop to take to trade
24
   shows to give away as gifts to tourists coming to town.
25
```

```
MR. LINDEMAN: So there is -- in that
 1
 2
    case there is HOT money going into the gift shop?
 3
                   MR. RAY:
                             Yeah.
                                    To buy stuff?
 4
                   MS. EVERETT: A purchase, yes.
 5
                   MR. RAY:
                             To buy your door prizes --
 6
                   MR. LINDEMAN:
                                  Well, not every page that
   has gift shop is American Express. There is a bunch of
   other stuff in here. So I don't know -- I will look at
   it and see, but I would invite you to look at it, too.
10
   Because I just found that confusing.
                                         Okay, I yield.
11
                   MS. EVERETT:
                                 That's why we have a
   bookkeeper.
12
13
                   MR. LINDEMAN: Still sounds to me like
14
   co-mingling.
15
                   MR. RAY:
                             It is.
16
                   MR. FORBUS: The floor has been yielded.
   Who would like to pick up the gauntlet?
17
18
                   I have a question. And I was just going
19
   through here and looking at -- well, it's office
20
   supplies, building equipment, utility, office
21
   equipment, computer expenses and insurance, taxes, that
   went from -- I'm sorry. It's on the bottom of that.
22
23
                  MS. EVERETT: Uh-huh.
24
                  MR. FORBUS: You see it there? Starting
25
   in 2005 and 6 it was twenty-one nine, in 2006 and 7 it
```

was twenty-seven six. And in 2007 and 8 it jumped to thirty-one four. It jumped -- I'm sorry, it jumped 3 twenty-three percent between 2005-2006 and 2006 and 2007. And another sixteen percent between 2007 and 4 5 2007 and 8. The total jump in two years -- we've got three years, forty-three percent in expenses for -- and I don't know see the computer expenses having jumped that -- didn't jump that much. But insurance jumped, utilities jumped a thousand dollars between 2005 and 6 and 2006 and 7. And another twenty-eight 10 11 hundred the year between 2006 and 7 and 2007 and 8. Τo me that just seems like an awfully big jump in expenses 12 2005, 2008. Is there a big reason for the expenses? 13 MS. EVERETT: No. Just the utility 15 costs went up. MR. FORBUS: That much? MS. HEILAND: What years are those? MR. FORBUS: Well, 2005 to 2006 and 2006 to 2007. It's on that same page. The three pages. 20 The figures are down there. So it seems to me like a tremendous jump. A thousand dollars and twenty-eight 22 hundred dollars in utility expenses. I mean, if my 23 bills jumped up like that I believe I would go talk to Entergy about it and see what the heck was going on.

14

16

17

18

19

21

24

25

Maybe their meter is wrong.

```
1
                   MS. HEILAND: Or is this is just a
 2
   budget form?
 3
                   MR. FORBUS:
                                No.
                                     That's just expenses.
 4
   That's what the expenses were. Isn't it, Dee? Aren't
 5
   those the expenses there?
 6
                   MS. EVERETT: Are you talking about the
 7
   right-hand column?
 8
                   MR. FORBUS:
                                Yeah.
                                       At the bottom,
   office supplies, building equipment, utilities. It was
   thirty-one four seventy-eight and then the year before
10
   it was twenty-seven six forty-one and then before that
11
12
   it was twenty-one nine. So just seems like a big,
   tremendous jump in expenses over -- actually a two year
13
14
   period.
15
                   MS. EVERETT: Can I look at the page
   you're looking at? I'm not seeing what you're looking
16
17
   at.
18
                  MR. FORBUS:
                                Right here, see. See that
   figure there, that's from 7 and 8.
19
20
                  MS. EVERETT: Are you talking about this
   total number?
21
22
                  MR. FORBUS:
                                Right.
23
                                 Okay.
                  MS. EVERETT:
24
                  MR. FORBUS: And then this total number
25
   is twenty-seven and this number was twenty-one nine.
```

```
MS. EVERETT: And those were increased
 1
 2
   as the total expenses of the organization in this area
   increased, the operations, utilities did get higher.
 3
                   MR. FORBUS: So the utilities jumped up
 4
   from -- looks like we picked up the whole utility bill
 5
 6
   here.
 7
                   MS. EVERETT:
                                 No.
 8
                   MR. FORBUS: Looks like here is your
   utilities --
10
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 No, no, no.
                  MR. FORBUS: Here, let me show you where
11
   it -- where are the utilities? Here they are.
12
   Forty-one to fifty-one. It went from -- here is your
13
   utilities, ten to eleven. So we picked up the whole
14
   thousand dollars -- actually it went up eight hundred
15
16
   and we picked up a thousand.
                  MS. EVERETT: If you gain from there you
17
   lost some elsewhere.
18
19
                  MR. FORBUS: But the bottom line it
20
   keeps increasing, tremendous. And that's forty-three
21
   percent in two years.
                  MS. HEILAND:
                                These aren't actual
22
   numbers.
             This is what you just --
23
                  MR. RAY: Allocated?
24
25
                  MS. HEILAND: Allocated.
```

This is another subjective 1 MR. RAY: 2 percentage. MS. HEILAND: 3 This is another percentage. And how do you base the percentage? 5 MS. EVERETT: The total percentage is -the part of the Chamber that it takes to operate this And we have building maintenance. function. look at the total operations for the Chamber, if you look at, say, page -- 2008. If you look at that 10 eighty-six thousand six forty-seven. The money that is 11 paid by the tourism contract on the right-hand side, you only pay thirty-one thousand four hundred 13 seventy-six for total usage of the building and any 14 maintenance that we have, any office supplies, all of those things, it's that one sum. 15 16 MR. FORBUS: Actually -- paid in a 17 separate -- all of that is paid separately by -- in another, the postage --18 19 MR. RAY: That's the Chamber's part. MR. FORBUS: Yeah, but our postage is 20 21 paid elsewhere. So this eighty-six thousand that you're saying thirty-one percent is -- or thirty-one 22 23 thousand is a part of isn't accurate? 24 MS. EVERETT: Okay. So you would back 25 out the postage then.

```
MR. FORBUS: Probably telephone
1
   expenses, too. Don't we pay telephone out of something
2
3
   else?
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                No.
                                     You pay the toll free
4
   line which is incoming and that's a separate line.
5
   to postage is paid directly to the program for which it
7
   happens. It's not included in the operations.
8
                  MS. HEILAND: What I'm looking for is --
   somebody have their calculator out? Thirty-one is to
9
               What's the percentage?
10
   eight-six.
                  MR. RAY: I quess you would have to add
11
   them together to do the splits.
12
                  MS. HEILAND: I'm just wondering --
13
                                    You're pulling that
                  MR. FORBUS: No.
14
   out of here.
15
                  MR. RAY: No, that's not. Those are two
16
   separate.
17
                                What I'm saying is, if we
                  MS. HEILAND:
18
19
   follow what I'm seeing is you cannot do allocations
   unless they relate to the amount of time spent on the
20
   benefit. I think that's one way of stating it. So we
21
   can look at that a little bit closely.
22
                            Here's the question.
23
                  MR. RAY:
   seven thousand utilities and the rest of the entire
24
   functions is only ten thousand dollars, so almost half.
25
```

```
Six thousand building and equipment, nothing over here
 2
   at all to pay for. Office expenses, seven thousand,
 3
   office expenses nine-thousand, all in about forty
   percent.
 5
                   MR. FORBUS:
                                Okay.
                                       That was just a
   question in my mind.
 6
 7
                   MS. HEILAND:
                                 We'll fix that up.
 8
                   MS. EVERETT:
                                 When you look at the
   building and equipment you have two different line
10
   items that go into that. You have equipment lease and
   then you have the building maintenance, and that's a
11
   combination of a couple of different lines.
12
                                                 It's not
   just directly --
13
14
                   MR. FORBUS: Well, that was just the
15
   thing that just jumped out at me like, man, that
   certainly has jumped up a lot so --
16
17
                  MS. EVERETT: Well, there is an awful
   lot of traffic in our building with visitors.
18
19
                  MS. HEILAND: Can I ask a question about
20
   the eight hundred number? The eight hundred number is
21
   800-289-0389.
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 Uh-huh.
22
23
                  MS. HEILAND: And this was the number
   that was put on the airing of the quilts and we didn't
25
   see that. That would be another ad that you all paid
```

```
for in the -- gosh, happened to get this out of the
1
   Chronicle spring bizarres and festivals. Okay.
2
   call that eight hundred number on the weekend nobody
   answers the phone.
5
                  MS. EVERETT: No. It's forwarded to the
   visitors center.
6
                  MS. HEILAND: No one answered.
   there is no message on it says come see the festival.
8
                  MS. EVERETT: Was it between normal
9
   business hours, 8:00 to 5:00?
10
                  MS. HEILAND: Yeah.
                                        I'm not that early
11
   a riser. So yes, it was definitely between then.
12
   you're saying that that -- normally that number -- you
13
   might want to check it.
                                Absolutely.
                  MS. EVERETT:
15
                  MS. HEILAND: Because I checked it later
16
   in the week, too, and it came -- it went directly to
17
   the -- I quess the progression is it goes to the main
18
19
   Chamber office first?
20
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                Right.
                                But if no one is there --
                  MS. HEILAND:
21
                                Chris forwards the phones
                  MS. EVERETT:
22
   when she leaves at night.
23
                                 So maybe it was just a
                  MS. HEILAND:
24
   forwarding glitch. But you might want to check that.
25
```

MS. EVERETT: Definitely. 1 MS. HEILAND: And it just seems to me if 2 3 this is an incoming line for visitors why not put on a message on your line upcoming -- you know, it just -because you're going to have times on the weekend when the visitors center is not open, either. And just -that's something that I picked up when I was looking into that. 9 MS. EVERETT: That's a good point. 10 I really don't know why that didn't get forwarded but we'll check into it. 11 MS. HEILAND: Let's see, I got this --12 MS. EVERETT: The message is important, 13 14 too. MS. HEILAND: And I just was 15 Yeah. 16 curious why there wasn't a message just like everybody has. 17 18 MS. EVERETT: Sure. MS. HEILAND: 19 We're not here at the time. Maybe that's not part of the service yet. 20 We do have it. 21 MS. EVERETT: No. MS. HEILAND: Well, thank you for 22 calling, call back between such and such a time, that 23 type of thing. Also, this is the kind of package 24 you're talking about that. You call these fulfillment 25

packages or is that the phrase? 1 MS. EVERETT: In some cases, yeah. 2 MS. HEILAND: And I got this when I went 3 to the round table, the history department. Just so that you all might want to see how they package some of the materials. There is a pencil in here, Huntsville Texas, dot com. That's some of the examples, some of the materials that we have. And this is just what you say that Sam Houston is pretty good about asking --MS. EVERETT: Oh, yeah. They will tell 10 us that they have a conference coming and how many 11 people they expect to attend and, you know, make sure 12 that it's an out of town conference. 13 MS. HEILAND: Well, it wasn't an out of 14 town conference I can tell you that. It's mostly 15 people --16 17 MS. EVERETT: Well, we can only go by 18 what they tell us. Well, just a suggestion. MS. HEILAND: 19 On your survey, if you're doing these fulfillment 20 packets, I really -- this was a conference that was 21 primarily faculty from the history department, local 22 townspeople. There were some out of town people, 23 There were moms of some of the kids -- they 24 right.

were giving speeches and there was an out of town --

couple of out of town speakers. I'm not saying that there weren't any out of town speakers. But it just may be another way to measure impact. You ask at that point -
MS. THOMAS: On the presentation it

MS. THOMAS: On the presentation it does -- on the call sheet we do ask that question.

So -- but, again, it is based on what they tell us, you know. We don't ever want to say that is untrue so we do base it on what information they give us.

MS. HEILAND: I think that I probably helped stuff some of the bags with a lot of these materials already. So -- all right. I will let somebody else go on. I have a few things I want to check on in a few minutes. Oh, yes, the convention and visitors bureau. I take that back. The convention and visitors bureau has been in existence how long?

MS. EVERETT: Mid '70's.

MS. HEILAND: And it's made up of representatives from --

MS. EVERETT: All --

MS. THOMAS: Okay. The staff is a total of myself, Jaime, Shana and then we have four to five part-timers. Outside of that everything else is volunteer.

MS. HEILAND: But you have a board?

```
MS. THOMAS: I'm sorry, and Chris.
1
                  MS. HEILAND: I guess I was getting to
2
   the board.
3
                  MS. THOMAS: Yes. Our board consists of
4
   about twenty-five.
5
                  MS. HEILAND: (Inaudible). And the way
6
   I'm seeing the budget set up is you got part of the
7
   money now for the visitors bureau and then you got the
   visitors center and then you got the visitors gift
         That's the way it seems to be separating out
10
   shop.
   now.
11
                  MS. THOMAS: Yes.
12
                  MS. HEILAND: It's changed over the
13
                  So the convention and visitors bureau
           Okay.
14
   has about eight people and then you have a board?
15
                  MS. THOMAS: Yes.
16
                  MS. HEILAND: Does the board review the
17
18
   budget?
                  MS. THOMAS: Yes.
19
                  MS. HEILAND: For this convention --
20
                  MS. THOMAS: Yes, they do.
21
                  MS. HEILAND: And they monthly look at
22
   the expenditures against that?
23
                  MS. THOMAS: Yes, they do. And Mr.
24
   Forbus has actually sat on our board the last what, six
25
```

```
months now?
 2
                   MR. FORBUS: About four or five months.
 3
                   MS. HEILAND: And they have always done
   that?
 5
                   MS. THOMAS:
                                     As long as I know,
                                Yes.
 6
   yes.
 7
                                 The Chamber board reviews
                   MS. EVERETT:
   it as well.
 8
 9
                   MS. THOMAS:
                                Both the executive and the
10
   Chamber board, executive board and the Chamber board.
11
                   MS. HEILAND: And what kind of reporting
12
   do they get? Something like this?
13
                   MS. THOMAS:
                                Pretty much what you
14
   receive and the monthly report that I --
15
                   MR. FORBUS: This is basically it.
16
                          (Discussion)
17
                   MR. FORBUS:
                                It's basically this, right?
                   MS. THOMAS:
18
                               Yes.
19
                   MR. FORBUS: Basically this report.
20
                   MS. THOMAS: With the financials
21
   attached it to and everything.
22
                   MR. FORBUS: Must have the loudest one
   in town.
23
24
                   MS. HEILAND:
                                 Since I really have --
25
   since I'm not on the counsel I wouldn't have seen your
```

budget presentation. Do you have a work plan with measurable goals every year of what you're going to do? MS. THOMAS: Measurable, no. 3 MS. HEILAND: Okay. We're going that 4 direction. 5 MS. THOMAS: Okay. 6 MS. HEILAND: It seems to me. 7 standards that would relate to activities that would directly -- meet the two pronged test, I guess we call it the two pronged test, okay. So I think that is 10 something we could maybe talk more about, how we would 11 go about having those measurable goals. 12 MR. FORBUS: I think Winston is going to 13 address that in a few minutes. 14 MS. HEILAND: Great. Thank you. 15 MR. FORBUS: Anyone else? 16 MR. RAY: I have -- unless anybody else 17 Dick? Go ahead, Wayne. wants to go. 18 MR. BARRETT: Well, something we haven't 19 talked about because it's not our business to talk 20 about it, but the Chamber of Commerce has a life, 21 22 activities, a lot going on. It has a mission beyond the issues that we are talking about tonight. 23 I'm just wondering, I guess, is there some overlap, in 24

other words -- and I certainly don't anticipate that

any such thing is going to happen. But if the State ended the ability for us to even collect hotel tax, in other words, HOT money disappeared, would it be a part of the Chamber of Commerce's mission to do work -- would the Chamber of Commerce consider it part of their interest to do work in tourism irrespective of whether or not there was a such a thing as hotel occupancy tax money?

1

2

5

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. EVERETT: Yes. A Chamber of Commerce is here to help grow and develop the community and to make it a welcome place for visitors regardless of funding. And that's -- we want every business in this town to succeed and to do better regardless if they are a member of the chamber or not. That makes no difference. We want everybody to be a success here. We also want other people to know what a great community it is and would invite people to, in any respect, to come and visit our community. And I think that's one reason why, you know, half the chambers in the State are doing tourism as part of their program in cooperation with the city. Because we are a logical place for people to go first when they want information.

MR. BARRETT: Now, is there anything -I know a lot has come up tonight about changing the

paradigm a little bit.

MS. EVERETT: Uh-huh.

MR. BARRETT: For reporting and measuring. And you have -- you have answered a lot of questions. I appreciate that. I guess I'm just wondering, before we sort of close this out this evening and move on to something else, is there anything that's come up that -- related to what you would anticipate that we're wanting that you're not comfortable with or -- and that you would want us to talk about a little more or anything that has been mentioned that you feel like would be burdensome or just any response that you might have to the things --

MS. EVERETT: No. I think if anything we want more of a sense of direction out of counsel and out of this committee. And, you know, we feel sometimes like the stepchild over there because we don't have a clear sense of direction and this counsel so (inaudible) do what you want to see and what you know or don't know. You know, there was a time when everybody on counsel was involved in helping build the statue and build the visitors center and do all of those things. Ya'll weren't a part of that process so you don't know the evolution of the product we have now. But, you know, I believe in this industry as an

incredible industry for Huntsville, Texas, because we don't have the major manufacturers, we don't have those big tax, you know, those big taxpayers in our community. But we have -- I'm trying to think of the I'm losing it. But we can export tourism or import tourists into our community and we're growing the community in that respect. The money in the community. It's not just the HOT money that grows. It's the retail sales tax, it's all the taxes. And it puts money in the pocket of everybody in town whether they're involved in tourism or not. And there are people in this audience who have spent decades, and I mean decades, working on building the convention and visitors bureau. It's not me and Kimm or anybody, you know, one single person. It's a process that's been over the years and years and years. And, you know, I can stand before you and tell you that we very justifiably believe that we spend those dollars and will give you some measurable accountability. But it is a process that has evolved into what it is today. And a couple of years ago, as far as when Bob was our city manager and then it was Kevin, you know, we were trying to renegotiate the contract so it worked better for everybody and that didn't happen. And so, you know, we have what we have because it's accumulated

1

2

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

over a series of years. And, you know -- the statement was made that we opened the gift shop as a favor to the city. Couldn't be further from the truth. We didn't do it as a favor or for them. We did it because it was good for our community and because it was something that they needed somebody to do and we were the logical group to do it because, number one, it couldn't make money. Because there were bonds on that building. And, number two, we were the only game in town who wasn't there to make a profit but was there to get people to spend their money in the community. I mean, that's why we had antiques on consignment out We had local craftsmen's things on consignment there. out there. You know, we tried to do -- have things that would exemplify our community and people would take home and, you know, (inaudible) would have a Huntsville, Texas shirt on or cap or what have you. So it's really part of the whole marketing of what we do, you know. And it is, you know, the comptroller said the other day it's more like an incidental to the visitors center. It's not the reason people go there, but it's very convenient for them and it helps showcase Huntsville and Texas. And our visitors have come from more than a hundred and ten foreign countries when they come to that statue. And if -- you know, and some of

1

2

5

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

these people back me up. If you weren't in Huntsville twenty years ago and you saw how many thousands every single day passed through Huntsville and didn't see what we have. Or maybe pulled off at McDonald's and got a cup of coffee. That was before we had all the road reconstruction going on. But maybe just popped off at McDonald's and then kept going. But now they see we have a visitors center. We have something of attraction to them. They stop there and we can sell Huntsville and market Huntsville to them. And they may not be going to a hotel directly from there that day. But I can promise you numbers of people have come back here because we keep trying to grow the product. We keep trying to add. I mean, we've got a beautiful veterans museum coming on line, beautiful. And we have a veterans conference center now. We have the prison museum up. We have the Sam Houston museum. You know, those are things people want to come see. They're historical, they're cultural. And so we have a whole product that we try to base all of that on. And it is very hard for any community our size to say, you know, okay, that brochure put a head in that bed that night. It's not easy to measure. What we can measure, though, is the increase in the industry from one year to the next. And like it or not, it's the only measurement

1

2

3

4

5

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

24

Kolkhorst is the tourism caucus chairman. And she sent out a packet the other day that was all about Texas tourism and what it puts in the local economy and she used the same Dean Runyon report we do.

MR. FORBUS: Yeah.

3

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15 l

16

17 l

18 l

19 l

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. EVERETT: It does not count every citizen who goes to the gas pump. It's very methodical. It's done by an outside company. And that is the measurement tool that we have that can show all of it. Does every dollar in there get spent because of what we do? Of course not, of course not. Every Coca-Cola somebody drinks doesn't happen because of that ad that they place today. But it's a bigger It's a whole product. And, you know, we get picture. criticized sometimes, you know, well, why do you have a Dallas brochure in your visitors center? Because we want them to cross sell us just like we cross sell When they think of a smaller community they want to go and stop in and spend some time, we want the same reciprocal from them. And it works. Because we have built these networks up over all the years. We're part of the Texas Forest Trail because you have many communities that have attractions in the forest industry and somebody can do that sort of thing and

it'll take them from one end of Texas to the other.

And we're a part of that, you know. And we hope that they spend the night with us but it may be this trip around they spend it in Lumberton or what have you.

2

3

4

5

6

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. FORBUS: And I think probably that information you're putting together to go out to the different motels as far as why did you come to town? Well, I came back because of something that I saw earlier. Or I came back because of some other event that is going on or, you know, whatever. That kind of measurement is what we really need. Like you said, I think the Runyon report is very good information for the community. It doesn't tell you exactly who is spending money and how it is being spent, but it is good to know that that kind of money is being spent here in town. I think it helps our business people along with some of the leakage reports I think that is going to give people an idea whether they need to locate their businesses here. So I think that is good. I believe that anything we can do as far as bringing tourists to town, whether they are local -- local, not local tourists, but within the radius, short radius, and eat here or buy something here, I think that's a great accomplishment. They come here to see a museum and then grab a bite somewhere, that's money in the

pocket of the businessman. So I have no problem with that kind of --

MS. EVERETT: And, Mr. Barrett, I can't, you know, really answer for what the whole chamber board will want us to do with any of the information. But I do know that they take this contract, you know, very seriously. We want to do the right thing. And we want you to tell us what the right thing will be, what terms (inaudible).

MR. BARRETT: And I just wondered if there is anything off the cuff, you know. We mentioned some things tonight about some record keeping and time keeping. So, you know, I think we're not maybe going out of here with everything nailed down but with certainly an idea of the type of --

MS. EVERETT: Absolutely.

MR. BARRETT: -- documentation that it looks like we're going to need to be in compliance. So I just wanted basically your reaction to that just to see if you saw anything immediately that might present a problem or if it sounds like something that ya'll will be able to slide into without too much trouble.

MS. EVERETT: Well, and I have to be real honest. Ya'll don't compensate my time at all, at all. And if I have to keep track of all the time that

I spend in tourism it's going to be substantial. 1 MR. FORBUS: And you should. You know, 2 that's part of the costs, part of the expense of doing 3 the -- bringing people to town. 4 MS. HEILAND: But up to the budget. 5 MR. FORBUS: Up to the budget. 6 MS. EVERETT: Yeah. But I'm saying --7 yeah. We're trying to do it as economically for you 8 and that's --If it's any consolation MR. LINDEMAN: 10 to you we're not getting paid for this, either. 11 MS. EVERETT: I know, I know. 12 Trust me. But one thing --MR. FORBUS: 13 all we're really concerned with is transparency. 14 MS. EVERETT: We are, too. 15 MR. FORBUS: Yeah. And we want to make 16 sure that we are in compliance because it could cause 17 legal ramifications that we do not want. Like the guy 18 said, it could be an irate citizen or it could be a 19 hostile hotelier. And, you know, we don't want that. 20 We don't want to run into that because then you start 21 getting into legal expenses that we just can't afford 22 This guy is expensive and we don't want to go any 231 further than that. 24

MS. EVERETT: He's been marking every

fifteen minutes.

23 I

2 MR. SCHNEIDER: Six.

MR. BAINE: He does. He sends us a bill about every other week, a draft and then a final one. He does a pretty good job, actually.

MR. FORBUS: He's a good resource.

MR. BAINE: So far he's cheaper than our last one (inaudible).

MR. FORBUS: I want to yield the floor. So anybody now before it's over?

MR. LINDEMAN: I have a couple more loose ends here. We're obviously not here to do a detailed audit. We're just trying to begin to get a feel for the group picture. But would you say a few general words about what should a taxpayer --

MS. EVERETT: Uh-huh.

MR. LINDEMAN: -- in the City of
Huntsville make of a few charges like this that are on
the ledger? And I'm not saying there is anything wrong
with the charges. I'm just asking for what would be a
kind of the rational. There are a lot of charges on
here to restaurants, for example. Shipley's Donuts.
And I have learned so far that the key to all of this
is this number column here, the third one from the
left. Because if you follow the numbers you can go

```
find out what that was for. And here, for example, is
1
   a Shipley's Donut charge of $14.98.
2
                  MS. EVERETT: Uh-huh.
3
                  MR. LINDEMAN: And it's for a CVB
4
5
   meeting.
                  MS. EVERETT: Yes.
                                       That's all our
6
7
   volunteers fed.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. So we're paying
8
   the volunteers. That's what that's for.
                  MR. RAY: No, we're feeding them, not
10
   paying.
11
                  MR. FORBUS: I've had a few kolaches.
12
                  MS. EVERETT: Yeah. He's down for
13
   several of them.
14
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. How about the
15
   Rotary Club? I mean, I'm just going down the list.
16
   I'm not picking on anybody, I'm just going down the
17
          That's the next one I saw. Here we gave $75 to
   list.
18
19
   the Rotary Club out of HOT money.
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                That was probably when
20
   Rhonda was a member and she was the -- she was a member
21
   of Rotary and that was her association dues. Is that
22
   in '06?
23
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                 That's in '06, yeah.
24
                  MS. EVERETT: Yeah.
25
```

MR. LINDEMAN: Her association dues? 1 2 MS. EVERETT: Yes. MR. LINDEMAN: What association dues? 3 To the Rotary. MS. EVERETT: 4 represented Huntsville Convention and Visitors Bureau 5 in the Rotary Club. 6 MR. LINDEMAN: Would that be a 7 legitimate expense? 8 9 MR. RAY: No. She worked on conferences MS. EVERETT: 10 for the Rotary Club. She helped recruit different 11 people to come to Huntsville for our Rotary Club for different reasons. And part of the whole convention 13 and visitors bureau product is the people in your 14 community. If they don't know what is here to sell and 15 to do then they won't refer other people and that word 16 of mouth is your very best advertisement. 17 MR. RAY: Can I interrupt here for a 18 Because we keep hearing wonderful anecdotal second? 19 evidence about how this word of mouth gets out. 20 the law is very clear and the comptroller was very 21 That's why they use the term directly. clear. 22

Indirect gets us cooked. And everything you just
described is a hundred percent indirect. It has to be
directly related to tourism. It can't be that we're

```
going to go stand on the street corner and scream and
1
   hope somebody hears it and they go out of town and tell
2
   people. It's got to be directly related. And you can
3
   go look at what happened to San Antonio when they
4
   didn't keep up, they don't have any. Sorry, go ahead.
5
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                McKenzie's Bar-b-que?
6
   Seventy-five bucks to McKenzie's Bar-b-que.
7
                                I don't know what that was
                  MS. EVERETT:
8
   coded to. Sometimes it is a conference that we're
   helping to host a reception for in some way, it's an
10
   event. You know, I can't detail those specifically.
11
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I can't help you there.
12
   I don't know where that number --
13
                         (Discussion)
14
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I just happened to pull
15
   the first one, September, 2006.
16
                  MS. EVERETT: We do take volunteers to
17
   the visitors center.
18
                               That was actually, I
                  MS. THOMAS:
19
   believe, a San Marcos group that came on board, a group
20
   that came in, and we had dinner -- I mean lunch.
21
   we provided the lunch for them at the Wynne Home.
22
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                  Good memory.
23
                  MR. FORBUS: Was that the baseball
24
25
   meeting?
```

```
MR. LINDEMAN: Curiosity, did they stay
1
   overnight?
2
                  MS. THOMAS: They did stay overnight.
3
                  MR. LINDEMAN: All right, so we're all
4
   right. That one's okay (inaudible). Some of just
5
   these seem fairly legitimate just on the surface.
6
   Sam's Club, I guess we're -- $107 at Sam's Club.
7
                  MS. THOMAS: Probably servicing a group
8
                  Supplies for a meeting or event.
9
   or something.
                                         I quess we could
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah.
10
   follow the money here. I'm just trying to get a
11
   general feel. Here is my friendly statue gift shop
12
           There are several of these -- now, this is in
   aqain.
13
   the CVB part of this. There is Shipley's Donuts again.
   Gift shop again. Betty Nelson.
15
                  MS. EVERETT: Betty gets mileage because
16
   she is representing us as the Central Texas Bluebonnet
17
   Travel Counsel.
18
                  MR. LINDEMAN: There is Rotary Club
19
20
   again.
                                 That had to be back in
                  MS. EVERETT:
21
   06.
22
                                 Yeah.
                                         This is '06.
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
23
                  MS. EVERETT: Kim's not a member.
24
25
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Mr. Gatti's Pizza, $30.
```

Meeting. MS. EVERETT: 1 Heartfield Florist, \$40. MR. LINDEMAN: 2 There is just a lot of those kind of things in here 3 that you just kind of wonder about. 4 MS. EVERETT: One of the things like if 5 there is a conference or something and they ask us to 6 help with the reception, or what have you, you know, we 7 might spend a hundred dollars and they are spending, you know, a thousand dollars on ten rooms, you know. Ι mean, that's just a simple analogy. But -- and that 10 would be when we would have to buy some of those things 11 for hospitality. 12 Would we have records MR. LINDEMAN: 13 laying around like you talked about where we know that 14 that money was spent to host a group of people from San 15 Marcos and they did, in fact, stay overnight? 16 MS. THOMAS: Oh, yes. 17 MR. RAY: Make the comptroller happy. 18 MR. LINDEMAN: So we could -- you could 19 show us a few of those kind of things. That might help 201 a little. 21 Would you like to have --MR. FORBUS: 22 can you provide some of that information? 23 l

MS. HIGBIE: Sure.

25

MR. FORBUS: Okay.

MS. HEILAND: I have -- also going down 1 that track, I have pink marks all over here for things 2 like The Gallery. That's a frame shop. The statute 3 gift shop. And is it correct, if you're buying a --4 MS. THOMAS: We do through some of the 5 different events and things that we attend we might 6 sponsor, in order to get our name out there -- what do you call it, give away for silent auction or something. And we might have to have a print framed or something. So that might be why to Gallery is in there. Just 10 different scenarios there. 11 MS. HEILAND: Those will be for local 12 activities? 13 I'm talking about like MS. THOMAS: No. 14 when I go to like TTIA or TACVB and those events, unity 15 dinner, silent auction through TTIA, those type of 16 17 events. MS. EVERETT: And sometimes like we have 18 a resident here who goes to a conference and is trying 19 to promote our community, when they go and so they ask 20 for something. 21 MS. HEILAND: So we're subsidizing 22 statute visitors center with HOT money? 23 MR. RAY: Yes. 24 25 MS. HEILAND: And things.

MR. RAY: We're getting stuff for it but 1 2 we are. MS. EVERETT: We're making purchases 3 there at a reduced rate. MS. HEILAND: I don't know, I suppose --5 the Huntsville High School Grenadier Gard, one-quarter 6 page ad, September 30th, 2008. 7 Those are in the programs MS. EVERETT: 8 that go to away games and in Huntsville games. 9 MS. HEILAND: And away games? 10 How far away? MR. RAY: 11 Outside of Walker County. MS. THOMAS: 12 MR. RAY: Madisonville? 13 Madisonville Meteor? MS. HEILAND: 14 MS. EVERETT: Advertising. 15 MS. HEILAND: KSAM? 16 MS. EVERETT: We've advertised for the 17 visitors center there. 18 MR. RAY: Let's talk about that a 19 I notice that and I've got this on here and 20 second. highlighted and underlined. I notice that starting in 21 early 2007 we start seeing payments -- this isn't from 22 the visitors center, this is from CVB budget --23 l directly to both the Huntsville Item and to KSAM. 24 l turning to KSAM, they start rather abruptly in January 25

and they're recurring, totaling about sixteen hundred forty-five one year and then sixteen hundred the next I filtered through here and the only ad I found 3 was the one you talked about coming out to our visitors center, shop locally. So I don't think that's one of 5 these. What is the radius on KSAM? MS. THOMAS: Goes to Conroe and 7 Madisonville, I quess. 8 MR. RAY: You're asking people, putting 9 out ads come stay in Huntsville from Conroe, assuming 10 it goes that far, which I don't believe it does. 11 MS. THOMAS: Oh, it does. 12 MR. RAY: Not on my radio. You lose it 13 somewhere between Willis and Conroe. Regardless, how 14 many other radio stations get HOT money? 15 MS. EVERETT: Any that we advertise in. 16 But Kimm made the -- she placed the ads, not me. 17 MR. RAY: How many other radio stations 18 have we paid HOT money to advertise? 19 MS. THOMAS: I can only think of one 20 other that we paid. And I can't remember exactly when 21 l I want to say it was sometime during last we did it. 22 And it was -- I can't think of the name of the 23 radio station but it's out of the Woodlands. 24

MR. RAY: Is it local?

MS. THOMAS: Out of the Woodlands and it 1 reached all of Houston. And it was during the time for 2 the Airing and Folk Festival. 3 MR. RAY: Let's get back to --4 I do want to say something MS. THOMAS: 5 here as it relates to that. During my first year and 6 part of my second year some of the codings -- and I'm 7 going to be totally honest here -- were misrepresented. 8 Not purposefully, but we have a marketing one and then just learning the ins and outs of how to code things 10 according to CVB, gift shop, visitors center, there 11 will be some errors in there. And I'm going to be 12 totally honest about that. And that was to my not 13 knowing or not fully understanding where each thing 14 lie -- or lay. 15 MR. FORBUS: Learning experience. 16 MS. THOMAS: Learning experience. So it 17 will be some -- especially the end of 2006 and 18 beginning of 2007. You're probably going to see a lot 19 of different things there. 20 MR. RAY: That's fine because these 21 permeate all the way through 2008. 22 MS. THOMAS: Okay. 23 MR. RAY: And continue apparently 24 through the current day. The question is how can we 25

```
possibly justify giving money to one radio station and
1
   one only with the limited radius and claim it's
2
   directly related to tourism? A station that happens to
3
   be managed by your husband.
4
                  MS. THOMAS: Some of that is due to
5
   when -- and I can pretty much say pretty much all of it
6
   is probably when the teams were in playoffs or
7
   something of that nature and they were broadcasting
8
   from abroad.
                                 Whenever our teams like
                  MS. EVERETT:
10
11
   the --
                  MR. RAY: I'm sorry, broadcasting from
12
   abroad?
13
                                Well, they would travel to
                  MS. THOMAS:
14
   the games and broadcast them.
15
                  MR. RAY:
                            Broadcast them here. They are
16
   not renting tower space in, say, Dallas.
17
                  MS. EVERETT: They broadcast them on the
18
19
   internet.
                  MR. RAY: On the internet?
20
                  MS. THOMAS:
                                Yes.
21
                            And that's what we're paying
                  MR. RAY:
22
   for, a sporting event? I'm sorry, this doesn't wash.
23
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Well, I don't understand
24
       Would you say again what it is?
25
```

MS. THOMAS: When the teams go for play 1 off game or something and they travel away from 2 Huntsville. The teams you mean --MR. LINDEMAN: MS. THOMAS: It could be Sam Houston, it 5 could be the Huntsville Hornets, it could be New Waverly, any of those teams. 7 MR. LINDEMAN: Okay, so the Hornets 8 going to Brenham? 9 MS. THOMAS: Yes. 10 MR. LINDEMAN: How does that work here? 11 MS. THOMAS: Because they do broadcast 12 on the internet with it and people do tune in and 13 They do tune in and listen. listen. 14 That's not the question. MR. RAY: 15 question is how does it bring overnight guests to 16 Huntsville listening to the Hornets play in Brenham? 17 And I don't think they play in January and in February. 18 MR. LINDEMAN: Basketball. 19 MR. RAY: And June. 20 MS. EVERETT: (Inaudible) when she was 21 advertising for the open house at the statue gift shop 22 that she inadvertently placed it to that line and it 23 l was just a mistake. 24 MR. RAY: But those also appear in the 25

```
visitors center gift shop ledger as well, KSAM ads.
 1
   We're not talking about those. Those are there.
 2
                                                      The
   ones you're talking about are over there in that one.
 3
   I'm talking about the CVB HOT money -- who signs the
 5
   checks on this account, by the way?
                   MS. THOMAS: I would have to look at
 6
 7
   those and, you know (inaudible).
 8
                   MR. RAY:
                           Do you sign these checks?
   signs the checks on the CVB account? The HOT account?
10
                   MS. THOMAS:
                                I do not sign any checks.
11
                   MR. RAY:
                            Who signs the checks?
12
                   MS. THOMAS:
                                It would be Dee.
13
                   MS. EVERETT:
                                 I sign them and we have
   two other signers on the board.
14
15
                   MR. RAY:
                             Who are those?
16
                   MS. EVERETT: Our chairman and our
17
   treasurer.
18
                  MR. RAY:
                             I also notice the Huntsville
   Item started getting some money early in '07. What is
20
   the justification for that? Inviting people in Bedias
   to come in?
21
22
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 We have to look at the
23
   statements and what it was for.
                                     In some cases, you
   know, we just have to pull up the ad. It just depends
24
25
   on what it was.
```

```
MR. RAY: How could you possibly bring
 1
    someone to stay overnight in Huntsville by running an
 2
 3
   ad in a local paper with a limited distribution?
 4
                   MS. EVERETT: It's not always the only
   measurement when we're trying to do some sort of
 5
   promotion for something that is going on.
 7
                             Well, I checked the dates and
                   MR. RAY:
 8
   it just so happens that these dates coincide very
   closely with some rather large Ravenwood ads that were
   run in the Huntsville Item. Did you use HOT money to
10
11
   pay for Ravenwood ads?
12
                   MS. EVERETT:
                                 Absolutely not, Mr. Ray.
13
                   MR. RAY:
                             Then what ad were they?
14
                   MS. EVERETT: I do not know.
                                                 I did not
15
   code them and I would be happy to look at them.
16
                   MR. RAY:
                             Are we going to get those
17
   then?
18
                                If we can get them.
                   MS. EVERETT:
19
                   MS. THOMAS:
                               We could pull the invoices,
20
   examples would indicate (inaudible).
21
                  MR. RAY: How many other papers do
   we advertise in here? I don't see any except for
22
23
   periodicals.
24
                  MS. HEILAND:
                                 There was Madisonville
25
   Meteor and Navasota Navigator or something, I don't
```

```
1
   know.
                   MR. RAY: Examiner.
 2
 3
                   MS. HEILAND: Examiner, sorry.
                   MR. LINDEMAN: Why would we advertise
 4
 5
   there, I wonder?
 6
                   MR. RAY: Beats me.
 7
                   MR. LINDEMAN: I would think we would be
   advertising in Houston, come spend the weekend in
 8
   Huntsville.
                   MS. THOMAS:
                                We do.
10
                   MR. RAY: In the brochure in the
11
   Chronicle, the little Life section thing?
12
13
                  MR. LINDEMAN: How come there are no
14
   Huntsville Chronicle -- Houston Chronicle -- I didn't
15
   see a Houston Chronicle charge in here. I may have
   just missed it.
16
17
                  MR. RAY: Do they have a different
18
   billing address?
19
                  MS. THOMAS: I think it's under --
20 l
   because it's the community paper I don't think it says
   Houston Chronicle. I think it's HC or something like
   that.
22
23
                  MS. HEILAND: Would those also possibly
   be on the American Express card --
25
                  MS. THOMAS: There are some
```

```
advertisements that come through on American Express
   and that's their only form of payment. So there are
 3
   some there.
                  MR. RAY: I didn't see any on the credit
 4
 5
   card roll out here.
                  MS. HEILAND: Neither did I.
 6
 7
                  MS. THOMAS: There are some.
                                                 I can't
   say which ones they are, but there are some
 8
   advertisements that do request. I think one of the
   Austin papers.
10
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 Some of those would be an
11
12
   agency creates them, did they bill us for the ad or
   just the newspaper, itself?
13
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Would it be appropriate,
14
15
   Mr. Chairman, to --
16
                  MR. RAY: Mr. Chairman bugged out.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Oh, did he. Who is the
17
   chairman pro tem?
18
19
                  MR. RAY: You are.
20
                  MR. BAINE: Some of these things are
   going to get corrected because she is going to
   present -- they are not corrected now but they are
22
   going to get corrected (inaudible). Some of this stuff
23
   won't be approved (inaudible).
24
25
                  MR. LINDEMAN: In the future, yeah, I
```

quess so (inaudible).

11|

13 l

MR. RAY: While we're waiting I would like to backtrack on something. We asked for all of these documents and you sent them to us with a cover letter that -- where you say you're not going to give us some of them because you're not a governmental agency and, therefore, are not subject to open records request. Initially this was not an open records request. It was a request pursuant to statute and contract. So the citation to the public information act is inapplicable.

Second of all, and the city attorney can either refute me or back me up on this, any account you drop tax money into becomes subject to an open records request. I don't even think that is a close call.

Leonard?

MR. SCHNEIDER: That's substantially correct.

MR. RAY: Okay. We're had in the past people say substantially correct and we had to beat them to get them to say what they meant so --

MR. SCHNEIDER: I don't want to be beaten. In most circumstances whenever a chamber is funded by public funds or HOT funds, where there is an overlapping public purpose, which this appears to be

the case, it is subject to the public information act. 1 So I will agree with your assessment. 2 MS. EVERETT: But I have to be honest, 3 our former chairman, Will Durham, called when we had another open records request and talked to the Attorney 5 General's Office and he told us, his advice was that the records of the Chamber were not subject to the open records act. MR. RAY: That's not what he said, 9 listen. 10 MR. SCHNEIDER: That's correct. Only 11 the records that are related to the public funds are 12 subject to the open records request. 13 l MS. EVERETT: Yes. 14 15 MR. RAY: Right. Everything we asked for was related to the HOT money. 16 MR. LINDEMAN: Yes. 17 MS. EVERETT: Yes. But when you talk 18 about, you know, like salaries of Chamber employees 19 20 and --When you designate that you MR. RAY: 21 are assigning a percentage allocation to charge the 22 city of HOT money based on your assessment of the 23 percentage being used by your in-house operations, we get to know what one-hundred percent is. In order to

know what one-hundred percent is you have to show us That is all we asked for. We didn't ask for your pay stubs or anybody else's. 3 MS. EVERETT: We gave you those numbers. 4 5 MR. RAY: Right. MS. EVERETT: Right? 6 My point is you are subject to 7 MR. RAY: the public information act by any percentage out there and, in fact, because of the statute and the contract any person can walk off the street tomorrow and say let 10 me see your HOT fund books and you're supposed to say 11 there they are, immediately and promptly. I just 12 didn't appreciate the I don't have to give you stuff 13 because we're not a government entity. And I'm not 14 15 sure who you're getting your legal advice from but have them put it in writing. 16 MS. EVERETT: The AG's office told us 17 that, call Will Durham. 18 Have them put it in writing. MR. RAY: 19 Where are we? I was out of MR. FORBUS: 20 the room for a moment. 21 MR. RAY: Dick had something for you, I 22 23 think. MR. LINDEMAN: Well, I was just -- I 24 don't know if it's a good idea or not. I was just 25

toying with -- I'm a little intrigued by this advertising pattern. I don't understand -- I guess I associate myself with the remarks that were made earlier. I don't understand how you bring tourists to town by advertising in a local newspaper and a short range local radio station. Now, I do understand capturing the traffic on the freeway. I think that is a, you know, that is a semi-legitimate point at least. But I don't understand why we're not spending most of those dollars in the Houston Chronicle or the Dallas paper or whatever.

MS. EVERETT: Mr. Lindeman, we are.

Most of those dollars go out of this community in
advertisement.

MR. RAY: Where is it?

MS. EVERETT: That was a small case of it. We advertise in Texas Monthly, Texas Highway, newspapers all over the state. That that payment that you see for Texas First, that is an ad that goes in multiple papers throughout four or five different states. And so you may not recognize it as the Houston Chronicle but that may, in fact, be one of those cities that that ad is going to.

MR. LINDEMAN: So that's a charge that would be in here somewhere if I were smart enough to

figure out where it was? MS. EVERETT: Yes. Very little of it 2 3 stays here. And if it does it's in the name of tourism, not necessarily the heads and beds. And we have, you know, we have certainly heard loud and clear how you feel about that. 7 MR. LINDEMAN: Well, I don't want to create any unnecessary work, but I would like to see a 8 few pages of this ledger annotated as to which of this money is going to -- well, I can tell the locals. 10 11 understand that. But I would like to know what's going 12 out of town. You know, pick a year or something and --13 MS. EVERETT: Sure. 14 MR. LINDEMAN: And you know, pick 2007 15 or 8 or last year, whatever you want to do. Pick a year and let's do an annotated --17 MR. FORBUS: Let's do 2008. 18 MR. LINDEMAN: Okay. 19 MR. FORBUS: That's current. 20 MS. EVERETT: We can do that. 21 MR. LINDEMAN: I would be interested in 22 out of town radio, television, whatever you're doing in

MR. FORBUS: Now, let's summarize a

MS. EVERETT:

the way of advertising. Both locally and externally.

Sure.

23

24

```
little bit of what we're expecting to get from you guys
   here. Have you made -- we want to get from -- Dick,
2
   you want a list or an annotation of --
                  MS. THOMAS: Advertising.
4
                  MR. LINDEMAN: For the moment, at least.
5
   I don't want to go any deeper than this. I would just
6
   like to understand what this is talking about in terms
   of the advertising.
                  MR. FORBUS: You were going to provide
9
   something regarding how to evaluate what your program
10 l
   of bringing people to town.
11
                  MS. THOMAS: Yes.
12
                  MR. FORBUS: We're going to get bank
13
   statements or -- what was it you asked for?
14
                  MR. RAY: Bank statements, real bank
15
   statements, not bank statements summarized.
16
                  MR. FORBUS: You can give them to
17
   Winston and he can redact the numbers.
18
                  MS. EVERETT: Could we ask to bring
19
   those Monday since the city is closed tomorrow?
20
                  MR. FORBUS: Absolutely. We don't want
21
   Winston to have to come in and get that.
22
                  MS. EVERETT: Promise.
23
                  MR. FORBUS: All of these items -- what
24
25
   else was on the --
```

```
Bank statements.
                  MS. HEILAND:
1
                  MR. FORBUS: Bank statements we just
2
                  I'm sorry?
   talked about.
3
                  MS. HEILAND: Credit card.
5
                  MR. FORBUS: Oh, credit card --
                  MR. RAY: Credit card monthly statements
6
   as opposed to year end roll up of the expenses.
7
                              Again, give it to Winston.
8
                  MR. FORBUS:
   He can redact the credit card number off of it.
                  MR. BAINE: We're putting the credit
10
   card information on the web now.
11
                         (Discussion)
12
                  MR. BAINE: Any city employee that uses
13
   a credit card --
14
15
                         (Discussion)
                  MS. HEILAND: And the annotation, then
16
   perhaps we do need to pick a couple of the accounts,
17
   then we do need to see the invoice as well.
18
                  MS. EVERETT:
                                 Sure.
19
                                That way it'll have the
                  MS. HEILAND:
20
   backup -- part of it is then if somebody asks you a
21
   question like what was that for, I can't remember.
22
                  MR. FORBUS: How much it cost, yeah.
23
   What it was, who it was, bla-bla, the whole thing.
24
   Anything else from anybody else?
```

Since we are asking for a MR. RAY: 1 2 list. 3 MR. FORBUS: Okay. What do you call these things? MR. RAY: It's the KSAM copies written down the left side. It's 5 the transcript of the ad. I would like to see those for the ones that came out of the CVB. 7 MR. FORBUS: Can you get those? Okay. 8 MR. RAY: As far back as you can get 9 These are from '08 and '07 so it shouldn't be a 10 problem if we can get these. 11 MR. FORBUS: And were there any other --12 MR. LINDEMAN: And the Item ads as well. 13 And the Item ads as well. MR. RAY: 14 The last February report MS. HEILAND: 15 seemed a little light. I'm missing part of account 16 numbers. It's really very difficult to read the detail 17 for the CVB. I don't know if it was just the report 18 that somebody picked that they -- it's in a different 19 format than we've had before. 20 MS. EVERETT: This February? 21 MS. HEILAND: The one we just got. 22 least I think so. For example, all I have is the 23 visitors center. I have the cover sheets and I don't 24 have any of the detail. I mean, maybe --25

```
MS. THOMAS: I don't know.
                                               The report
1
   that Stephanie brought to me have the -- it have the
2
   balance sheet, it have the profit and loss and it have
   the ledgers behind it.
                  MS. HEILAND: No.
                                     It didn't quite make
5
   it to our packet.
                      See what I mean?
6
7
                          (Discussion)
                  MS. HEILAND: Yeah. See, there is no --
8
   the gift shop we got lots of detail on it, but on the
   visitor center and the others we are missing all the
10
   charge account numbers. We don't have any back up.
111
   Maybe it was just my packet.
12
                          (Discussion)
13
                  MS. HEILAND: Appreciate that, thank
14
15
   you.
                  MR. FORBUS: Okay. Is that all the
16
   requests for documentation?
17
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Do we know which
18
   employees work where? I don't but I'm just curious.
19
                  MR. RAY:
                            Yeah, I do. I got --
20
                  MR. LINDEMAN: You got a list here?
21
                  MR. RAY: Chamber briefing has them
22
23
   there.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I get confused by all of
24
   these name on here.
25
```

(Discussion) 1 MS. HEILAND: So we've decided that 2 3 we'll probably deal with the gift shop as a separate 4 topic? Yeah. We probably need to. 5 MR. RAY: You heard the comptroller. He said it was -- what did he say? Very unwise the way we're running it. MR. FORBUS: I think we're through with 8 Item C. Is there any other input on Item C, any other 9 questions? I see none so we're going to go to Item b. 10 And the majority of this is Winston's Duke. Thank you, 11 Dee. 12 MS. EVERETT: Thank you. 13 MS. THOMAS: Thank you. 14 MR. LINDEMAN: We should thank Ms. 15 Thomas, also. 16 MR. FORBUS: Thank you. We'll thank you 17 after awhile. Don't get too worried about this. We're 18 going to Section 5 at the bottom so relax. 19 (Short pause) 20 MR. FORBUS: Winston told me he would be 21 succinct so you know what that means. 22 23 MR. DUKE: Nothing. (Discussion) 24 MR. DUKE: This is a draft of the 25

community agency funding policy. That was drafted -actually Victor's group, and the model for this was
Bryan/College Station. Stephanie had gotten the models
several years ago and we at one time thought about
putting it in the financial policy. And when this came
up and Victor was given the task and took it back out
and modified it for Huntsville. And on this sheet I
have kind of summarized the different sections in the
policy. The policy basically is for budgeting for
non-profits and other programs.

manager. And then it's funneled out to committee. So
I have been asking council, so all the budget process
no matter whether it's capital, non products, whatever,
it had gone through regular city counsel first. And
the first thing it talks about is the contract partner
agencies. And those are agencies that have close ties
to city functions that provide a public service benefit
that really alleviates the city of certain work
demands. So we have a close relationship. It might be
several organizations involved with them. Being a
small community sometimes we only have one.

The best example, and it's true in most cities, would be animal shelters. Because of the demand it would put on both public works and public

1 safety if that function did not exist. So the city would have to deal with more resources. So Boys and Girls Clubs is recreation. The convention and business visitors bureau would also be in that category, although it's related to HOT money. It doesn't mean that they necessarily have to -- that organization has 6 I to perform those functions, but it's one that the city by contract has accepted, you know, out of necessity.

And the second one is outside service agencies. And those are really are non profit organizations that have specific programs. And that particular section of it I think has a three year requirement. And that doesn't mean that under this draft that you couldn't extend it beyond three years, but it's looking for a termination so that an organization can get funding on its feet and start the program but doesn't depend continually on public assistance to keep going. Those are examples.

All of these are set by counsel, whether they are contract partner agencies or outside service agencies, it's a determination of counsel. The ones that we've had lately that might fall into those categories might be something like Huntsville Promise, Safe House.

There is not a whole lot of difference

25

31

4

5 l

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

between sections three and four. The community agency funding review is mainly for smaller organizations that have loops, have ties to something in the community locally. Examples of that might be the Lakers, mens choir or other singing groups, exhibition and performing groups. So when something is presented to the city, I mean, it may have HOT money implications or it may have other fund implications and -- or a combination of either one. And a group might be presenting it without either one in mind. It's just presenting an idea to the city. So by budget it would be divided according to what source of funds that it might be funded by.

The last one that you're interested in is the hotel/motel part. The hotel occupancy tax funding for agencies, which is in Section 5. And in that fund it does list the different criteria. And the city manager mentioned that we probably need to add some language regarding heads and beds into that section. 5.0, it goes over tourism development, arts and culture. 5.04 is a section that really is a question and answer, more of a guideline that we probably (inaudible) that section. 5.05 goes over contract partner agency for hotel/motel funds. And contract partner funding, again, is something that

could be managed by the city or could be managed by a CVB, but it is meant for to be a managing contract partner. So our managing partner might oversee this. If you will go to the flow chart on the back.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

This is kind of my summary of how I envision that this process might work. Ideas are going to come from the public. They are going to come from individuals. They are going to come from departments. Usually they flow through departments. They might not. Probably ultimately if they develop a relationship with the city then they probably will be affiliated with some of the departments. Community development department has, you know, a good many of them. those flow down to city manager. You're also going to have different committees and boards. Some of them city affiliated, some of them loosely or completely independent. I have down here or cemetery, friends of the Wynne Home. It could be friends of the library, any 501-3c or city appointed board that might be coming up with programs and projects to submit to the city. So it would be submitted and incorporated into the city budget, which is the city manager's budget, proposed And then he would allocate it to the different committees. And if it's HOT board related it would come to this committee. If it were one of the others

it probably would be looked at by the finance committee.

MR. BARRETT: I have a suggestion to make on this flow chart. The graph, you know, I'm into graphics. But I would ask you to consider that perhaps a HOT board should be up where -- and in the same relationship to city manager budget as arts, cemetery and Wynne Home. May be on the opposite side interacting with city manager. Because I think at the end of the day the city manager should be the last person to have his hands on the budget before it goes through finance and comes to the counsel. The way this is set up you would have two streams and if you -- you had a budget coming from the city manager that went through the HOT board it wouldn't go back to him before it came to counsel. Just seems like to me that would -- that could -- it would be hard to manage that. Plus I think --

MR. DUKE: It comes back to him down below COH budget proposal (inaudible).

MR. BARRETT: That's the city manager down there as well?

MR. DUKE: Right, yeah.

MR. BARRETT: Okay, that's fine.

MR. BAINE: Do you really want to get

2324

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

25

```
into the -- would you rather establish priorities and
   look at results or would you -- or do you want to
 2
  evaluate every HOT idea?
 3
                  MR. BARRETT: I think the HOT board, one
 4
 5
  of its functions would be to have a role in budget
 6
  recommendations. But I just didn't read the flow chart
 7
   quite correctly. As long as it goes to the city
   manager before it comes to the counsel.
                                             In other
 9
   words, I think that would be very important if he's got
   to put it all together, you know. So that's fine,
10
   that's fine like it is.
11
                  MR. DUKE: And legally I think it really
12
   has to. It's the city manager's budget. So that final
13
   proposal incorporates everything in it in which case if
   you don't adopt the budget, that is the one that's
15
   going to be adopted (inaudible).
16
                  MR. BARRETT:
                                That's fine.
17
                  MR. DUKE: We usually set it up so that
18
19
   counsel is presented one document with all the
20
   submissions.
21
                  MR. BARRETT:
                                Yeah.
22
                  MR. DUKE: Any questions or suggestions?
23
                               We have a question from
                  MR. FORBUS:
24
   Kimm.
25
                  MS. THOMAS: I do have a question.
```

on page sixty-six when you give the test for the seven you said would fall within one of seven statutory provided categories. Actually it's eight. And even the comptroller kept leaving this out. The eighth would be the funding of transportation system for tourists.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. BAINE: If you will bring that to us -- bring that to us and we'll take a look at it (inaudible). The thing I don't like about this particular section is I think we need to be more direct about promoting hotel occupancy because that's really what all this has been about. And I don't -- as I read this over I keep seeing it diffused and if that's going to be the standard to promote hotel occupancy and the things I get by listening is that's what you're all talking about then we ought to go ahead and have it in our policy right ahead. And the eight thing about promoting transportation, I think that's like right on time provided that there is something of value to promote them. Like moving heads and beds to the conference center and back. And that would be ideal But, of course, it's targeted at larger situation. cities that have, you know, big, big venues. that's the only transportation thing that I can think of that would target hotel industry or something that

was actually moving people to and from conferences where people spent the night. But maybe there is some others that it's beside me what that would be. But in a big city where they have lots of events I can see it would be a way to fund public transportation.

MR. DUKE: Might want to refer to the statute. And one thing is he did mention that and I think the eighth one was presented is a sub set of one of the others, I'm not sure.

MS. THOMAS: It's not a sub set. It is actually a separate. But one of the good things about that is that, you know, as we go forward and as we look at transportation could be a means -- and it wouldn't be for every group of course, but say for instance we did have an opportunity to bring a larger group in and we say hey, we can provide this, that could be the determining factor to get a larger group here. It wouldn't be every case but --

MR. BAINE: Right. There would still have to be some test. You wouldn't want to spend \$20,000 for fifteen nights in a hotel room. You would still have to have some kind of a test.

MS. THOMAS: Yes.

MR. DUKE: We might want to refer to the statute in the policy. Is that a good idea?

MR. SCHNEIDER: Yes. 1 2 MR. BAINE: Maybe the HOT board would be a good title. Maybe you can put a line in there for 3 transportation and the HOT board decides what 4 5 transportation (inaudible). 6 MR. RAY: I'm sorry, what statute you 7 say -- did you say just transporting tourists around or 8 transporting them to and from a convention center? 9 MR. FORBUS: To and from convention 10 center. MS. THOMAS: It would be to an event. 11 12 It would be to an event. And actually it's in here. 13 (Discussion) 14 MR. SCHNEIDER: I have already addressed 15 that issue with the city manager at one time regarding that eight topic and I'll send it out to Winston again 16 17 if you want to short-circuit this process. 18 MR. FORBUS: Yes. Let's do that. certainly do. 19 Let's go on. Let's move forward. MR. DUKE: We're seeking comments on any 20 21 proposal to draft and any changes. And we're into the 22 budget process already so it's very timely that we move 23 forward. 24 MS. HEILAND: I'm not sure where it

would go in here but I really think that sum and

25

```
1 substance of what we talked about tonight is that any
   group has to present particulars about what they hope
  to achieve, measurable standards, the substantiation,
   and how -- you know and then the reporting period at
   the end. It just occurred to me that having gone to
   one of Linda's arts commission budget processes and
 7
   she's, you know, you mentioned it, it's a lot of
 8
   documentation is required to get $3000.
 9
                  MR. FORBUS: It would be the same for a
10
   hundred thousand dollars.
11
                  MS. HEILAND: Yeah.
12
                  MR. BAINE: It's the same for eleven
  million dollars.
13.
                  MS. HEILAND: Yeah. And that's the
14
15
   process that --
16
                  MR. FORBUS: Sorry about that
17
   (inaudible). I think that's coming up.
                                             I think
   Winston is going to address that when it come to the
18
19
   budgeting process.
20
                  MR. DUKE: I think that's a guideline
   and some of this broadly is in here as far as wanted to
21
   make sure you could request a budget and even
22
   financials. And we did have a case, you know, where
23
   there was a financial problem with an organization that
24
25
   the finance committee met with twice one time.
```

each one of these is a contract. And it's spelled out to be approved by the city attorney (inaudible) contracts and it does have those (inaudible). That's all I had on that. Unless anybody has any comments.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. LINDEMAN: I have one comment, Mr. Chairman.

MR. FORBUS: Go right ahead.

MR. LINDEMAN: If we're going to go to the trouble of building this section five let's make sure that we can pull it out and use it in case somebody comes in and wants to know how we are managing HOT funds. And I think we accomplish that if we have a good statement of what our city policy is and our own procedures. But I also think we probably need a matrix stuck in here which relates what we're doing to the requirements of the statute. So that if somebody comes over here, if we do get audited for some reason, or even if someone just comes over and shows an interest, we can pull this out and say look, we read -- we took the trouble, the City of Huntsville took the trouble to read 351 and understand those requirements. And we are making sure we are implementing those requirements and here is how we are doing it. You can go to this paragraph of our document and it will say -- it will reference back to that sub paragraph in 351 and say

that's how we're doing that so --

MR. FORBUS: Let me make a suggestion,

Dick, would you be available to get with Victor and -
I guess Victor is putting this together is he --

MR. BAINE: If you just write the language that you want because I have marked this up while we were doing it, too.

MR. LINDEMAN: I just want to stick a matrix in there that relates what we're doing to the requirement of the statute so that we can show an auditor that this is how we are implementing that.

MR. DUKE: That is something we include in new contracts, every one of them, whether it is effective or not. That does have that language that they are supposed to attempt to meet this requirement.

MR. FORBUS: Okay. Onward.

MR. DUKE: The next thing is budgeting. We have a word document. And I have a hand out that I (inaudible) sent to me. It's on the budgeting process. Gives an example of (inaudible) you and I have talked about budgeting quite a bit and I wanted to show you by this how budgeting kind of evolved in the financial world and relate it to kind of what we do in the city. And I felt like this process was very conducive to what you were trying to do here. And particularly to the

hotel money in particular, much more easily than the city as a whole.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The first topic budgeting which in the beginning of budgeting was traditional line item budgeting which most everyone still uses. It's based on history. If that -- one of its flaws is (inaudible) year after year, use the same box. You don't look at outside parameters. There was zero based budgeting and the term was kind of made popular by Jimmy Carter even back, you know, in the late 70's. We do some of that here into our budget software where we ask them to start basically from zero and to itemize everything that is going to be in there. So if there is five thousand or ten thousand there should be documentation in there what it is going to be. And sometimes, I mean even if it's a contingency, we made great progress with that still not there yet on everything. GFOA in particular and the accounting world as well as accounting standards board is beginning to promote performance measures in particular. And they have a long time of measures and a lot of people began by having what I call work load (inaudible) or inputs. For example, fifty fires and a hundred calls. And now they're pushing for what they call efficiency measures, which is pretty much what you're looking for to attach

to a contract. Those are results oriented. And it might be the percentage of fires responded to in five minutes with the goal set of you want ninety percent to be in five minutes. So then you come back and see the results and if you don't make it there might be good reasons that you don't. So that's part of the process, too. Then we see that you're theoretically supposed to change the measure.

Program budgeting followed, which is pretty much by function as by call centers. We do some of that but it's still line item based. True program budgeting, the State of Texas tried to do it with one of their health and services or community departments and I think had marginal success with it. But it is like you budget, set the mission, you establish the program. I want to give you a million dollars and I'm not particularly interested in office supplies and that but I want to know what you did with it and here is the parameters. I expect you to come back and report on it.

Budgeting for outcomes takes a little bit of all of these. Another name is balanced score card. It's program based. It's based on cost of service oriented. It's tightly interwoven with performance measures. And it's a situation where you

go out and make an invitation or an offering to -could be departments, public, individuals -- to submit proposals for the service. Now, true, city based budget outcome -- and there is not many that do this well -- try to do it with departments. And some of it comes naturally. For example, we talk internally of whether we're going to do in-house or outsourcing solid waste. (Inaudible) management, payroll, even from time to time meter reading. So virtually when it comes down to it every city service could be possibly outsourced. Even some cities outsource public safety. Of course, we even have a public safety contract ourselves. Some of it is harder to do. But theoretically even accounting could be done that way where we would have to come back and say, you know, you want this type of performance, you want these type of reports, this is how much we think it will cost to do that and you would actually be competing in the outside and corporate world.

1

2

4

5

6 I

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And the sense of this is that you open up the box for out of the box thinking rather than to be with traditional turfs, traditional line items, and do the same thing over and over.

As I sat through these meetings that's what I hear from, you know, this group. That

regardless of whether something is in compliance or not you want something more effective or you want something proven to be effective. You want to see some new ideas rather than to do the same thing. So this might gear itself to lending proposals on whether we do a gift shop or not, how it's done (inaudible) that type of thing. Even theoretically a Linda Dodson, a Linda Pease, even the Chamber could think out of the box without thinking that this set of the money is just theirs or for them and they can't cross because theoretically any one of them might could do portions of it. So you kind of open up the lateral thinking submitting proposals. And I've heard different discussions of opening up the proposals for different part of it. You know, out in the public and deciding what you want to do with the hotel/motel tax money. The -- I don't have one of those.

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

(Discussion)

MR. DUKE: I wasn't going to say a lot about this. But in this particular city they were saying that -- start with a set of results and if you know what we do here, we do the city, the vision, mission statement, then we do the comprehensive plan and what we call the strategic plan and annual plan. And most cities the strategic plan is the comprehensive

plan and it's reversed. But those are in good budgeting, you would tie all the department objectives and then down further, if you could, to one of those mission statements. And budgeting a lot of times (inaudible) would set the parameters of what it wanted and even some of the performance measures and then send the thing out for proposal. So you would set a broad mission statement, a vision statement, and tell the public, you know, what you're looking for, including the city, itself, to get the city to start thinking differently. And then the important key to this is they do not fund processes, they fund outcomes. So that's basically what I had on that. That leads us to where we are on the next one. Are there any questions related to that?

MS. HEILAND: I guess what popped in my mind when we went through here, I think one of the things that has been troubling to me is we have so many under a lot of needs, not enough resource organizations in this town. If we could somehow have as one of the results, one of the outcomes, being able to fund some portion of those operations so that people, visitors would have something to do when they come here. And I will use the Gibbs-Powell house as an example. I mean, we can't -- there are several others, you know,

```
1
   organizations like this. Maybe one of the limitations
   is people don't want to come here (inaudible) because
 2
   there is not really quite enough to do. We just need
   to have some other, some means, just pie in the sky
   thinking, but some means to sort of get that taken care
 6
        So I don't know, just a thought.
 7
                   MR. FORBUS: I think that's what this
 8
   (inaudible).
 9
                   MS. HEILAND:
                                 I'm on the right track on
10
   thinking?
11
                   MR. FORBUS:
                                Absolutely, yeah.
                                                   I think
12
   it gives people the opportunity to be creative, think
   outside the box --
13
14
                  MS. HEILAND: And partner together.
15
                  MR. FORBUS: And partner. You know, the
16
   Wynne Home and Chamber might come up with a program
17
   that would really benefit the city.
18
                              Maybe the Chamber would sign
                  MR. BAINE:
19
   up or someone would sign up to promoting -- or maybe
20
   Matt will sign up to trying to get -- I read in here
   where if we have ten sporting events that go to a
21
22
   certain level of criteria, whether playoff, so on, or
23
   tournaments, that we can use hotel money for it.
24
   one of our goals is that we get ten events that people
25
   would come from outside the county to come into town.
```

```
1 Maybe that's what it is. Maybe it's ten events,
   period. Maybe it's a combination of sporting events
3 and other big cultural events that would require you to
   spend the night. And there has been a lot of different
4
   ideas.
                  MR. FORBUS: Maybe we could have an art
6
7
   off.
                  MR. BAINE: A what? An art auction?
8
                  MR. FORBUS: Art off. Bring in artists
9
   and they go down to the last guy, last artist standing.
10
                  MR. BAINE: Maybe a tournament --
11
                          (Discussion)
12
                  MR. BAINE: One thing about it, if you
13
   use live swords they would get off the dollar pretty
14
1.5
   quick.
                  MS. HEILAND: Okay. That would be
16
   something to explore. Not the art off, I'm sorry. But
17
   you could have umbrellas, cultural tourism -- I mean,
18
   you could have broad umbrellas that that would fall
19
   under.
20
                  MR. FORBUS: Which would probably
21
   bring -- have more events than just one day. So
22
23
   anyway, onward.
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I do have one question on
24
   this, Mr. Chairman. Winston, you said something that
25
```

```
concerned me just a little bit. You talked about
 1
   outsourcing what the city is doing in the accounting
 2
 3
   system.
 4
                   MR. BAINE:
                               No.
                                    He was using an
 5
   example.
 6
                   MR. FORBUS:
                                That's an example of a
 7
   possibility.
 8
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                  Okay.
                          (Discussion)
 9
                  MR. FORBUS: Get away from that.
10
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I hope that you haven't
11
   heard anything in this meeting --
                  MR. DUKE: (Inaudible) talking about
13
   outsourcing myself than say the water department or
14
15
   solid waste. I mean, theoretically, bottom line there
   is every inch of it and there is certain things that we
16
   discuss every day that we don't even think about it and
   talk internally and usually comes up in the budget
18
             That it's not carried this far.
                                               There are
19
   process.
   some cities that are trying to carry it that far.
20
21
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Well, part of my
   nervousness, I read a version of this some months ago,
   it's a different version than this, and if we or anyone
23
24
   implemented what I read it would require a fundamental
25
   change in your accounting system, your whole way of
```

doing business internally.

Winston and he did it on his own, it is very commendable. I would like to have goals that have achievable results, measurable is in those goals. So I think it would serve us well in audits. And if we were trying to improve the occupancy rate by two percent, if that was our goal, and if at the end of the year we did it we can say well, we did it. If we're trying to do -- accomplish something else, improve the quality of our historical sites, if that was one of our goals in order to get to be better in that department, just something that's measurable. I think you would be more at peace, too, wouldn't you?

MR. LINDEMAN: Well, I don't mind setting goals, that's fine. But if you take this very far you're doing more than just setting goals.

(Discussion)

MR. DUKE: One example is sitting here. I mean, in managing even the legal department. You know, we have gone probably in-house to doing that.

MR. BAINE: We had a lot of controversy and it sort of works out so far. When it stops working out we'll go back.

MR. FORBUS: We'll go back to line item

accounting, yes. 1 MR. LINDEMAN: That's fine. But you 2 don't change your fundamental way of doing business 3 just because you outsource a function. You don't change your accounting system, you don't change your management system. 6 MR. RAY: Are we still talking HOT 7 money? 8 9 MR. LINDEMAN: Well, they are inferring from what we are saying here that we want them to do 10 that and if they are inferring that I'm objecting to it 11 because I don't want them to do that. I don't like 12 this. I did have a responsibility one time in the 13 federal government for a budget function. 14 kind of stuff comes along every once in a while and it 15 always winds up getting you in more trouble than it does you good. 17 A lot of FWA in it. MR. BAINE: 18 MR. LINDEMAN: Yeah. So I would be very 19 20 suspicious of this. In this town, I don't know 21 MR. BAINE: how you get around with FWA. You have to have a real 22

MR. LINDEMAN: You know, the kind of activity we're talking about is not of sufficient

niche to get around with FWA for very long.

23

24

25

volume to change anybody's way of doing business. We might want to modify what we do in accounting system somewhere. I would be very reluctant to even ask the Chamber to modify their accounting system even if we find a few things wrong with that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. DUKE: This doesn't have anything to do with accounting system that I'm talking about.

MR. FORBUS: This is programs for outcome.

MR. DUKE: It's a way of -- it's basically program budgeting. It's performance -setting performance measures, you know, and trying to get people to think of different programs and validate the money. It is very much the idea that I've heard here from this group for six or seven months, you know. It is a perfect example of it. Depending on how far you want to go. Now, on anything you do, you know, you could be way over here, left or right or in between. So I'm not even speaking to my accounting system, CVB accounting system, but it has to do more with how you're going to budget and get proposals in. There are certain decisions you're going to have to make on deciding what you want to do with the money and you want to continue with the present role or not.

MR. BAINE: I think they are doing a --

knowing what is submitting from an accounting point of view, what we're doing right here is redirecting all of our efforts to promote hotel occupancy. One can say that's pretty close to a zero based approach. You don't have any sacred cows, no sacred cows. Nobody gets a defined contribution. And then you're letting elected officials decide what the priority of distribution is based upon what their performance is going to be, or the best you can come up with at this point. It could be wrong.

MR. FORBUS: Next is --

MR. DUKE: The proposals.

MR. FORBUS: Proposal for compliance

audit.

MR. DUKE: I was asked to go out and get proposals. And we actually have interest from several (inaudible) some of them I'm going to talk about generally. And we have (inaudible). We had actually contacted Mooney services which does the collection audit for the hotels expressed an interest. And we asked them. They were going to submit a proposal. When they saw the scope of work they referred us to another firm, consulting accounting, very similar to the one that you have in that booklet. And I only found out about that today. You know, if

the scope were changed that might change their mind somewhat. As we have gone along I tried to determine whether the scope should change, were we less interested in audit and more in something else. And what I keep hearing out of this is that no, we are still strongly interested in an audit. And specifically inventory and compliance and look at expenditures as well as (inaudible). That's what I'm hearing. If it's some of that or none of that and we're interested in going onto something else then we need to look at that correction.

The second one was a suggestion that I knew would do extremely well at this accounting wise at very low cost. And it was a firm that does a lot of governments. In fact, governments and banks is just about all they do. And they have more non profit and government clients than I could probably ever count. I'm not sure how many at this point. But even five or six years ago they probably had at least a hundred twenty. And they have been very cost effective, even locally, even though they have to travel. They had expressed interest in that. And were about a month ago or month and-a-half ago, and I said this is their busy season, they can't (inaudible). What they quoted we did some general talking, you know, was they suggested

that you might look at doing this in pieces. You know, if you're not sure how far you want to go. The general rates were \$75 for senior staff, \$60 for regular staff, \$150 for the manager.

more than a week and probably three days. We discussed inventory in particular. They -- and the financial audit. And I told them about some of the results. They said they certainly could do some of the pricing. They could not verify the inventory since they were not there, you know, during the inventory count. And which probably to do it correctly in the gift shop you can do another inventory (inaudible). So it wouldn't take that long. This is a firm that does know, you know, a lot of cities. They can look up CVB and do some research. So there was that avenue.

your booklet which came to the comptroller's meeting.

They had an accountant there and they had a consultant listening on the phone and that has expressed interest. And we have talked to a number of times over the past the month or so. And they submitted an initial proposal, which is not the one you're seeing here, and they revised it after the meeting with the comptroller. And after we specifically pointed out that they didn't

discuss inventory enough and there were certain specific accounting audit things that seemed to be interested in.

That firm is a partnership between a sub-contractor with an accounting firm in Houston.

They have a forensic auditor that would be the man that would be behind this. But on a consulting end they also, if you really wanted to look at the process on, you know, how to do proposals and relationship with CVB, probably has a good potential of raising (inaudible) of carrying it to a different level. So the initial proposal was twenty-eight, in here it was thirty-six, accounting for the extra time. And that for this firm would be a significant write down on fees. They indicated that.

MR. FORBUS: The last firm you were talking about, they were also going to -- they would also make recommendations regarding managing of how to proceed, how to go about managing the whole hotel occupancy tax --

MR. DUKE: Yes, everything.

MR. FORBUS: -- program? Okay.

MR. LINDEMAN: So it's really more than

24 an audit. It's a program management review actually.

MR. DUKE: Right. And if you took the

```
audit out or if you didn't do part of it obviously that
   makes --
 3
                   MR. FORBUS: Any questions?
 4
                   MR. LINDEMAN: I like the guy that came
 5
   the last time.
 6
                   MR. RAY:
                             He's in there.
 7
                   MR. LINDEMAN: He really knew what he
 8
   was talking about. I had a separate discussion with
 9
   him.
10
                   MR. FORBUS:
                                Any other questions?
11
                   MR. RAY: Can we use HOT money to pay
   for it?
12
13
                   MR. FORBUS:
                               Yes.
14
                   MR. RAY: What else do we need to know?
15
                   MR. FORBUS:
                                Okay.
16
                   MR. LINDEMAN: You can always learn
17
   something from something like that if nothing else.
                  MR. FORBUS: Well, we'll give this
18
   information time to mold in our brains and talk about
   it next time. I will put together a report to the
20
21
   council. I will send out my initial draft to the board
22
   members for your input and hopefully I will be able to
23
   either make a report to the council, the city council
   either at the next meeting or the following one.
25
   Anybody else have anything to add?
```

1 MR. LINDEMAN: You're going to have a little something to say about the Wynne Home in that 3 report, I trust? 4 MR. FORBUS: Yeah. In fact, Linda, we 5 weren't ignoring you today. 6 MS. PEASE: That's okay. 7 MR. FORBUS: It's just so much on the --8 you didn't want to stay another hour did you? 9 VOICE: No, sir, not tonight. 10 would like to provide you with a report as someone 11 suggested earlier about how other towns spend their 12 funds and how they make the hotel/motel tax work according to the law. 13 14 MR. FORBUS: I think that's exactly what 15 Wayne is looking for, yeah, and all of us are looking 16 My take on it is the next -- set the next meeting 17 date. How about the second Thursday in -- next month. 18 What date is that? Second Thursday. 19 VOICE: Mr. Forbus, the second Thursday 20 of each month is when the Arts Commission generally That's their regular meeting date. And we 21 meets. could change our meeting date and we have done that, 22 you know, for the couple of times that, you know, it 23 24 has been in conflict. But I just want you to be aware

25

that that's --

```
MR. FORBUS: Does that create a problem
 1
   for anybody if we -- in regards to the second Thursday,
 2
   does that create a big problem for you? Not really?
   Okav.
 4
 5
                  MR. SCHNEIDER:
                                   It's May 14th.
                  MR. RAY:
                             Five weeks away.
 6
 7
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                  That's a long way off,
   Mr. Chairman. I was thinking about a couple of weeks
 8
   from now. We're going to get an additional data dump
   tomorrow?
10
                  MR. RAY:
11
                             Monday.
12
                  MR. LINDEMAN: Monday, yeah.
                  MR. FORBUS: I think we need at least a
13
   couple of weeks to mull over whatever we got don't you?
14
15
                  MR. BAINE:
                               I think that our Director
   needs to go through all the data, all the presentation
16
   before it does because I may not agree with it.
17
18
                  MR. FORBUS: So do I have anymore input
19
   here? You say two weeks?
                  MR. LINDEMAN: I would recommend two to
20
   three weeks, something like that.
21
22
                  MR. FORBUS:
                               How about you, Mr. Barrett?
   You look like you have something on your mind.
23
                  MR. RAY:
24
                             That you want to share.
25
                  MR. BARRETT:
                                 Three would be May 7th; is
```

```
1
   that right?
 2
                   MR. SCHNEIDER:
                                   Three weeks would be
   April 30th and May 7th would be four weeks.
 3
                   MR. FORBUS: Let's go May 7th.
 4
 5
   May 7th?
                   MR. SCHNEIDER:
                                   That's one month.
 6
 7
                  MR. FORBUS: That's to give everybody a
   chance to catch a little sleep after this one, okay?
                  MR. BAINE: I believe that the manager
 9
   needs to -- or the Director needs to review it and that
10
   the gentlemen that I told to handle this needs to
11
   review it on top of that, so --
13
                   MR. FORBUS: Okay. That will give me
   time.
14
15
                  MR. LINDEMAN:
                                  In that case you may want
16
   to go back to your original thought. I was just
   thinking we were going to have a data dump here and
17
   ought to do something with it.
18
19
                  MR. RAY:
                             There's no council meeting on
   the 12th of May is there? It would be nice if this
20
   were an off week so we are not getting bashed two
21
   nights in a row.
22
                  MR. FORBUS: Let's do it the second
23
   Thursday in May. That's after the election, right?
24
25
                  MR. RAY: What election?
```

MR. FORBUS: Oh, that's not ours. Okay. VOICE: So we're now at the 14th? MR. FORBUS: Back to the 14th. original date. I'm sorry, folks. Okay, this meeting is adjourned. (Proceedings concluded)

| 1 | STATE OF TEXAS * |
|----|--|
| 2 | COUNTY OF WALKER * |
| 3 | |
| 4 | |
| 5 | I certify that the foregoing is a true and |
| 6 | correct transcription, to the best of my ability, of |
| 7 | the audio/video recording of the proceedings held as |
| 8 | provided to me by the City of Huntsville, Texas. |
| 9 | I further certify that I am neither counsel |
| 10 | for, realted to, nor employed by any of the parties or |
| 11 | attorneys in the action in which this hearing was |
| 12 | taken, and further that I am not financially or |
| 13 | otherwise interested in the outcome of the action. |
| 14 | I further certify that the transcription fee |
| 15 | of \$\frac{\mathcal{H}}{098,00}\$ was paid/will be paid by the City of |
| 16 | Huntsville, Texas. |
| 17 | WITNESS MY OFFICIAL HAND this the 27% |
| 18 | day of July , 2009. |
| 19 | |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | flewyn Co |
| 24 | Johnny D. West, CSR #542 |
| 25 | Exp. Date: December 31st, 2010 |